Friends and Foes Volume II

Friends and Foes Volume II
Friendship and Conflict
from Social and Political Perspectives

Edited by

Graeme Watson, Barbara Gabriella Renzi,
Elisabetta Viggiani and Máiréad Collins

CAMBRIDGE
SCHOLARS
PUBLISHING

Friends and Foes Volume II: Friendship and Conflict from Social and Political Perspectives,
Edited by Graeme Watson, Barbara Gabriella Renzi, Elisabetta Viggiani and Máiréad Collins

This book first published 2009

Cambridge Scholars Publishing

12 Back Chapman Street, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE6 2XX, UK

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN (10): 1-4438-0333-2, ISBN (13): 978-1-4438-0333-5

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE

As doctoral graduates in the arts, humanities and social sciences everywhere will know, life as a research student can be lonely and isolating, and if things go really badly it could turn into a soul-destroying nightmare of alienation. There is always a risk, as one seeks to become an expert in a particular topic, of losing one's bearings and becoming dislocated from the wider research context, unable to articulate the ways in which the key ideas that are driving the research are connected to the concerns of a wider academic audience and with cultural communities beyond. The struggle to situate our own expertise in a broader context is typical of, if not essential to, the quest for the recognition and research standing that comes with a doctoral study.

Academic supervisors and funding bodies alike are far more attuned than they used to be to need to offer support to students who are engaged in this struggle. Students are encouraged to attend seminars and conferences, to present papers, to engage in interdisciplinary research networks, even to organise research events. We may even provide resources to facilitate these efforts, all with the intention of helping students to find their own different ways of contextualising their research and connecting it to that of others, within and beyond their own disciplines. It is our responsibility to nurture an active community of emerging scholars, capable of working across traditional disciplinary boundaries on themes of contemporary social and political importance. But supervisors can do little if the students are not willing to engage themselves in this struggle for research connections. For this reason, it is most encouraging for me as Head of an interdisciplinary University School when a group of research students comes along, without prompting from staff, and offers to organise a major, interdisciplinary, international research event. It is wonderful when that same group of students goes on to organise an incredibly successful conference on an extremely well-chosen theme, while making minimal demands on staff time and financial resources. It is better still when they go on to produce some highly significant publications based on contributions made at the conference.

It has been my pleasure as Head of the School of Politics, International Studies and Philosophy (PISP) at Queen's University Belfast (QUB) to witness the production of this second volume of essays in the *Friends and*

Foes series. It is edited by four members of our School's research community – Barbara Gabriella Renzi, Graeme Watson, Elisabetta Viggiani, and Mairead Collins – and it emerges from a very successful international conference of the same name hosted here at Queen's in November 2007, supported by the School in conjunction with the University's Institute of Irish Studies. The theme of 'Friends and Foes' provided numerous lines of inquiry to connect research in a wide range of disciplines across the humanities and social sciences. While the first volume examined the topic of friendship and conflict from philosophical, literary and artistic perspectives, this volume investigates the theme from sociological, political and anthropological points of view. With essays included from both emerging and established scholars, each of the contributions collected here stimulate our thinking on the ways in which conflict and friendship interact as inescapable features of social and political life, in a range of contexts from the interpersonal to the national and global.

The social and political significance of friendship is easily overlooked, in much the same way that topics such as love and happiness have been overlooked for too long in social research, as if they were matters of little public interest. What society could possibly flourish, or even survive, if it failed to provide opportunities for the realisation of strong friendships, enduring love or the hope of happiness? Friendship is the glue of any well-ordered society. In an era marked by a rapid transformation of the nature of friendship through the development of social networking technologies and the ease of global travel – to name only two of many relevant factors – it is timely to examine the conditions under which friendships may flourish or flounder. The *Friends and Foes* series provides an excellent introduction to these fundamental issues that are at the heart of any such examination.

Shane O'Neill
Belfast, 21 October 2008

INTRODUCTION

The first volume of this series, *Friends and Foes: Friendship and Conflict in Philosophy and the Arts*, focussed on philosophical and cultural representations of the topic, found in literature, film and theatre. This second volume explores friendship and conflict from social and political perspectives. Together, the chapters provide a diverse and insightful examination of the issue, with contributions from political theorists, social anthropologists, sociologists, psychologists and educationalists.

Beginning with an essay by Malachi O'Doherty, it is hoped that the papers in this volume will appeal to sociologists and political scientists concerned with themes of conflict resolution, identity, social capital, community and well-being. The following is an outline of this volume's contents, as described by its contributors.

1. Malachi O'Doherty

Male Bonding: The Difference between Friendship and Camaraderie. Can Men Love Each Other?

The history of the troubles tells us of heroic bonding and self sacrifice among men, in the prisons in particular. It also tells us that comrades are bound by loyalties that are militarily underwritten; disloyalty is punishable, often by execution, and with the endorsement of the other comrades. How does this compare with friendship, which should be forgiving and allow for the sharing of secret feelings and fears? Yet other arenas of male bonding, from the schoolyard to the football terraces seem to follow the camaraderie model, which imposes uniformity and discipline. And if honest friendship is difficult within a camaraderie model, how much is it possible across the boundaries of a conflict? Is it feasible that people from enemy camps might form deeper friendships? What strengthens such friendships? The need to explain positions, to help the other comprehend one's own 'side'. What erodes such friendships? Ties of kinship, and the division of fear. Each is afraid of something different. I, as your Protestant friend, may be much more frightened of your neighbours than you are. This chapter essentially provides a contrast between two models of friendship; one comradely, within a 'camp', the

other across a boundary between factions. It argues that the conditions of division may impose a greater need for openness and understanding and actually produce deeper friendship. And that's what you would expect: i.e., that those who transgress the limits of factional living learn more about others and about themselves and become better people, more capable of understanding others and, therefore, of befriending them.

2. Jaime Rollins McColgan

The Songs of Yours and Mine: The Power of Performance and Techniques of Persuasion in Political Song

In Belfast, the image of Che Guevara adorns t-shirts, jackets, bags, patches, flags, and his slogans are even graffiti-ed on walls and street corners. Parades commemorating the twenty-fifth anniversary of the Hunger Strikes incorporated Basque and Catalan cultures as fellow comrades in a fight for equality and recognition, and in Derry the Palestinian flag flies alongside the Tricolour. Why have these symbols been chosen as a link between the communities, and what is gained through linking the struggle? To answer these questions, at least in part, this chapter examines political music in Northern Ireland and its changing dynamic within the Republican community. Using theories drawn from the work of James Scott, Cynthia Irvin, and Mark Mattern, it analyses the ties made between the Northern Irish Republican community and other groups who have struggled for social reform. With the recent rise of communication technology around the world, and with music a readily available and easily transmitted source of expression, it is not extraordinary that global connections can (and will) be made. The chapter focuses on Irish Republican political song, but the techniques of persuasion used in this type of music – to reconfirm commitment, influence the unsure, and educate the young – might readily be heard in any type of music endeavouring for a ‘rebel’ or political aim. At this point in Northern Ireland’s history, the songs serve to give a voice to the people’s emotions and remind them that past struggles are not new, nor are they alone. In Northern Ireland’s republican community, in the commemorations of events marking social change, composers and musicians facilitating the movement with music draw from outside sources to inspire and renew the motivation of the community. From Joan Baez to Victor Jara, Woodie Guthrie to Christy Moore and Cruncher O’Neill, the captivation of political song is difficult to ignore. Eyerman and Jamison assert that the artists’ ‘engagement was objectified in their art, and the

movement thus came to be embodied in them. When the movements in which they had been involved were no longer active, the ideas and ideals of the movements lived on in their art. And in many cases, they served to inspire new movements by helping to keep the older movements alive in the collective memory' (Eyerman and Jamison 1998: 12). As the world grows progressively more towards the global community it is today, songwriters and musicians incorporated tunes or events from other countries and communities to invigorate the movement, and to draw attention to atrocities happening elsewhere. The intimation that groups struggling for collective action have a bond strengthens the group's sense of justification, and creates a connection of friendship between communities through the music.

3. Laura Eramian

Conflict, Memory and Solidarity: The Campaign for Unity in Post-Genocide Rwanda

In 1998, the government of Rwanda established the National Unity and Reconciliation Commission in order to address the fundamentally ruptured social relations left behind by the 1994 genocide. Strategies for forging solidarity include judicial processes to prosecute alleged /génocidaires/, and the eradication of the identity cards which denoted each citizen either a Muhutu or Mututsi, and were instrumental in distinguishing enemy from comrade during the genocide. Now, so the discourse goes, everyone is simply Rwandan. The unity and reconciliation effort uses the language of "mending the tissues of society," which suggests that the state has implemented these strategies under the pretext that there is an idealized, harmonious pre-colonial past to which social relationships can and should return. This chapter examines the Rwandan unity and reconciliation effort as a project of social engineering implemented to overcome the genocide ideology. It questions the ability of the state's campaign to foster stability by concentrating on public spaces and institutions while private memory and relationships between friends, neighbours, and community members are mostly overlooked. On one hand, the state encourages all Rwandans to remember the genocide together at public commemorations intended to smooth relations between formerly antagonistic groups. Testimony, witnessing, and commemoration of victims are key strategies for forging unity both locally and nationally. On the other hand, state priorities suggest that groups and individuals ought to 'forget' and move beyond the memory of violence and the loss of

family, friends, and neighbours, the unity and reconciliation project paving a more peaceful way forward. There are thus conflicting messages emanating from the state: is remembering or forgetting the basis on which to build social solidarity for the future? How are unplanned outcomes emanating from these tensions undermining state expectations as to how the 'reconciliation' process will unfold in Rwanda?

4. Lasse Sonne

Transforming Conflict into Friendship: The Case of Nordic Co-operation

The Nordic countries' cultural, economic, political and social co-operation is known as one of the most successful co-operation and integration systems in the world that has created peace among a group of previous enemies. The Nordic region was before the 19th Century a region characterised by civil wars and wars between the countries. From the beginning of the 19th Century this changed completely. The idea of Scandinavism (the idea of the Nordic countries belonging together) evolved and one co-operation and integration project after another was initiated. The Nordic countries are today probably a more integrated unit than any other group of independent nation-states in the world. How did this happen and are the relationship between the Nordic states really not characterised by any conflicts at all? This chapter will discuss the abovementioned question on the basis of different examples in the Nordic co-operation history but in particular compare a Nordic co-operation model with the model of European integration, that is, what today is called the EU. A dominating argument in previous research literature has until now been that dynamics in Nordic integration is different from dynamics in European integration. The chapter argues against the myth however of ideological Scandinavism and of a particular so-called informality in the Nordic societies as most important for the transformation of conflict into friendship. It is argued instead that Nordic co-operation was more a consequence of a long term socioeconomic and socio-political path dependent process. The Nordic case is thus very reminiscent of the case of the EU. The sources used are previous research literature combined with new research carried through in the governments' archives in Denmark, Finland, Norway and Sweden.

5. Olive Wardell

Nietzsche's Friendship Theory and its Contribution to Peace-building

Friendship matters. It is an indispensable part of human existence. Friendship and its interrelation with conflict are central themes in the philosophy of Friedrich Nietzsche. His friendship theory is especially relevant today because it incorporates a healthy independence of spirit as well as inspiration to strive for perfection for the sake of humanity. This chapter argues that Nietzsche's philosophy of friendship makes an important contribution to peacebuilding because it encourages self-criticism and self-mastery and the arguments are supported by piercing psychological insights into everyday situations and events. For Nietzsche friendship is not for the sake of mutual advantage or enjoyment – it is for mutual inspiration and creativity. Each inspires the other 'to perfect himself and be the best that he or she can be'.

Well-acquainted with the pain of loneliness after the break-up of a friendship, Nietzsche held that we should still value it as a 'sacred institution' even though external circumstances sometimes cause the cessation of a friendship. We see the difficulties of getting on with those whom we actively dislike – it takes a lot of practice and patience to learn to live with others: 'How hard it is to digest one's fellowmen!' Nietzsche condemns Kant's notion of universal friendship, for it cannot be sustained without particular friendships and for friendship.

6. Adam Briggle and Edward Spence

Cosmopolitan Friendship Online

Briggle and Spence develop a normative ideal of cosmopolitan friendship online. They first provide theoretical and historical background. Next, they articulate and defend cosmopolitanism as an important aspect of moral identity in a networked world. They then argue that developing a cosmopolitan character requires friendships that cross barriers, thereby forcing reconsideration of prejudices. The Internet provides ample opportunity to cultivate such friendships, but their development will most often require more than mere opportunity. Structured and self-conscious uses of the Internet, however, can foster cosmopolitan friendship. The authors conclude by placing the ideal of cosmopolitan friendship online in the context of stoicism.

7. Cathal Kilcline

"They are French, we are Marseillais": Imagining Community in French Football

"They are French, we are Marseillais" chant the supporters of Olympique Marseille, the football club commonly perceived as embodying many of the essential characteristics associated with Marseille's distinct civic identity. France's victory in the 1998 football World Cup provided a contemporary and spectacular insight into the phenomenon of sport as a privileged site for the study of mass ritual and construction of national unity across an ethnically and racially diverse population. With reference to Benedict Anderson's concept of Imagined Communities, this chapter further examines the role of football in the construction of collective identities, specifically at a regional and local level in France. Particular emphasis is given to the unique example of Olympique Marseille as one of the foremost representatives of this Mediterranean port-city. The chapter examines how the friendship between supporters and players and thus the bond between the club and the city's population, is forged by means of a number of attributes perceived as being common to both. Furthermore, the rivalry between OM and the main club from the French capital, Paris Saint-Germain, which has in recent years descended into heated and sometimes violent conflict between the two sets of supporters, transcends sporting boundaries to reveal some of the tensions, both traditional and contemporary, in French society. The chapter thus examines the role of the Other in the construction of identity and hence elucidates the interrelationship between conflict and friendship.

8. Peter Yang and Jennifer M. Kidd

Elements of Supportive Friendship at Work: a Study on the Relationship Quality of Informal Career Support

This chapter discusses the results of a qualitative study of informal career support established between employees, focusing on the formation of friendship at work. Friendship at work was studied in terms of the evolutionary characteristics of strong support ties, analysed using grid technique. The elements of the grid comprise the phases of participants' informal career support relationship with network members, and with important others within and outside the organisation. Features of informal

career support at work that changed across different phases (initiation, maturation and separation) were described in terms of the elements of relationship quality elicited from the data (thirty-six grids). Friendship was defined as informal career support relationships developed into the maturation phase. Several constructs were generated to characterise the relationship quality of this phase. Frequent contact, easy to communicate with, unlimited topics of conversation, in-depth conversations, consistent thoughts, similar thinking styles and knowledge about each other represented the quality of supportive relationships between network members. In addition, empathetic understanding, positive regards, equal interactions and a high degree of free and relaxed feelings characterised network members' impressions of each other. Trustworthiness, positive affective reactions, intimacy and involvement in the other party's personal lives were highly related, and network members were seen as partners who were willing to provide support at work. A partnership and relationship commitment was formed between both parties, and network members strongly and positively evaluated the usefulness of the support relationship. Similarity and compatibility were frequently reported. This basis of commonality was mentioned by about one tenth of constructs. These results help to illuminate what constitutes the individual's sense of being supported from network members at work. Implications of such friendship at work for career management and career counselling are discussed.

9. Edmund O'Toole

Empathy & Socialization: Present in our Friends, Absent in ourEnemies

Empathy is a necessary condition for understanding others and for our other orientated emotions. Without empathy we could not feel for others or value them beyond utility. The first principled embrace of empathy in moral reasoning had been offered by philosophers of the Scottish Enlightenment. Hume, Smith and Hutchenson, had focused on emotional aspect of morality and on sympathy in particular. Sympathy had been considered as an emotion of active engagement through the faculty of imagination. It has not been a topic of concern for many philosophers and even for those dealing with emotions it has generally been neglected. Yet it has been dealt with in great detail by many psychologists.

The cooperative and reciprocal interaction of individuals within society is underpinned by empathic processes; empathy and conscience tempers self-directed self-interested nature and allows the development of

friendship. There are many levels upon which empathy may be structured, dependent on innate dispositions and developmental processes.

Many factors seriously limit empathy, including the extent to which it extends. A person may show clear compassion for family, friends or any other constellation, which may even extend to other forms of life, and yet act in a ruthless and exploitative fashion to those who fall outside the empathic circle. This is even the case for dyssocial or subcultural delinquents. This and other distinctions make the task of understanding moral behaviour in relation to *Other* clearer. Also of interest are those individuals who pose a more serious threat to intersubjectivity and socialization. Psychopaths have been defined as lacking empathy and psychopathy, in many ways, represent the diametric opposition to the concept of friendship.

This chapter seeks to address these issues and challenges the limitations of dispositional theories of empathy, which should offer some insight into how the *Other* is perceived as friend or foe.

10. Barbara Gabriella Renzi

Alberto Manzi and "E Venne il Sabato": Conflict and Friendship

This chapter explores Alberto Manzi's life by paying particular attention to the conflicts and the friendships present in it. It also focuses on his last book *E venne il Sabato*. This novel, published in 1986 after his death, was set in South America, in an imaginary city called Pura ("Pure"). It tells us a sad but hopeful story, the story of the violation of human rights and of populations reduced to slavery. The hope for a better future is made possible only by the bond of friendship between individuals. This relationship can be born and nurtured only when protagonists start respecting themselves as persons and start valuing their dignity. The chapter includes an interview with Stefano Renzi, his friend, nephew and collaborator.

CHAPTER ONE

MALE BONDING: THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN FRIENDSHIP AND CAMARADERIE. CAN MEN LOVE EACH OTHER?

MALACHI O'DOHERTY

Comradeship and friendship are not the same. Friendship is superior.

The bonding of men for war always diminishes the sexual side of nature. You can see something of this in the footage of soldiers coming off the boat to meet their wives and children. A clearly defined moment signals their permission to disperse to the wives. And the uniform and kit they wear for the first reunion kiss signals that the man is on loan to the family and that the serious grounding of his being is the army, where he is among comrades. The family's claim to him is a secondary claim.

There are many sentimental songs about men bonding at war, and like other sentimental songs, they probably overstate the natural condition. A local celebration of it is the Irish National Anthem which starts with the line: Soldiers are we, whose lives are pledged to Ireland.

Where songs get sentimental about the loss of the comrade, it is always because he has been a true soldier, killed in action. There are no plaintive refrains bemoaning the soldier who fell out of love with war and his mates and went home to be a carpenter and a dad. We know what becomes of the broken hearted lover. The slighted comrade, likewise, disowns you.

Not all men bond easily or there would be no need for the harsh penalties of betrayal. And it is a recurring theme in war fiction that men have to be bonded under pressure and discipline. That was the theme of the film *An Officer and a Gentleman,* starring Richard Gere, the making of a good soldier out of an ordinary feckless bloke.

Soldiering and comradeship are not prompts to adventurous radical thinking. Soldiers tend to preserve chauvinistic ideas like reverence for

Monarchy and the regiment without reservation of cynicism or irony. This can be a surprising thing to encounter in modern professional people who are often humane and have a sense of humour. The Royal Irish Regiment preserves a war cry once roared out to put steel in the men. The cry has gone into the record and onto the flags as the Irish for Clear the Way, Faugh an Ballagh. It's perfectly clear to anyone with an ear that the original was - fucking bollocks! - but you daren't suggest that in the officer's mess.

Soldiering can never be like another job. Some British army regiments are so wedded to ritual and custom that it can cost more money to pay mess fees than a soldier actually earns.

The soldier must be imbued with a respect for something more important than life itself. And such conditioning comes naturally, almost. If ordinary men could not be taught to value an ideal more than they value their own lives then they could not be sent to fight for that ideal in circumstances in which it made more practical good sense to turn and run away.

Another thing that bonds men in the services, to the exclusion of others, is their acquaintance with horror, which they cannot hope, or even want, to share with those who love them.

A soldier who had served in Bosnia says that on a posting to Cyprus, he saw bottle of slivovitz over a bar. He had only ever tasted that in the company of Serb fighters. When he tasted it in Cyprus, he immediately vomited.

Soldiers, policemen - I don't know about police women - others in services, say that they cope with horror by laughing. At the scene of an explosion, one turns to a co-worker and says, 'do you want a hand?' then tosses a hand to him and laughs. People who work in emergency services attest that such behaviour is common.

This is the side of their work that they wouldn't even try to explain to others who don't cope in the same way. And it casts light on the instances in which paramilitaries have been seen to run laughing from a murder. We read that as showing how savage they are - an ordinary soldier would know that many laugh in the face of death and danger because the alternative is to cry and be helpless.

Such men have said that they never laugh at the sight of dead children. But perhaps that just means there are limits to what they can confess to.

But in bonding men together through experience, the military culture produces an insensitivity to human diversity. It falls easily into superficial judgements of others. You hear this when soldiers talk of foreign postings.

They frequently make the kind of racist generalisations that embarrass the politically sensitive.

Who but the army would have been so insensitive on Remembrance Sunday to order a band, in front of the assembled representatives of the devolved regions and the Commonwealth, to play, There'll Always Be An England.

Soldiers seem gauche and ignorant at times to the rest of us yet live with a sense of superior insight. One of the clichés of the post-war years was the complaint of fathers who had survived the Second World War that their sons, who had not known it, needed to be licked into shape, knew nothing of the real world.

A variant of that was the paramilitary pressure on young people on housing estates in Belfast and Derry, who morally outraged the generation of men who had lived through more clear-cut times.

Armies are hierarchical institutions which demand obedience and young men, prone to doubt and angst, feel safe in obedience, so long as their peers agree with them on who is to be obeyed. This value of obedience has been celebrated in literature and tradition.

“Into the valley of death rode the 600”. Why? Because orders are orders. And are the 600 remembered as pliant fools? No, but as disciplined soldiers. The 'just obeying orders' defence took a battering in the 20th century. In truth it was only ever denied to those who lost wars.

The hierarchical system within an army is one that rejects the upward movement of ideas. A British army general last year lectured young officers on the need for the Judeo Christian ethic to maintain the quality of British soldiering. He said that it was because the British army was Judeo Christian that it was honourable and its soldiers didn't run prostitution rackets like those Kosovans.

When the officers present were asked afterwards why none of them had questioned this, when it is plainly obvious that most soldiers are not practising Jews or Christians, they said simply, 'because the sooner it's over, the sooner you get your tea'. When men get to be generals they live in a world in which no one contradicts them and they can bask in a sense that they are wise and revered.

The IRA in the prisons organised a tightly bonded organisation for which individuals members were prepared to sacrifice their lives. The priority of the cause over the family was acknowledged by the families themselves when they agreed not to intervene to save men on hunger strike. Once a man refusing food had slid into a coma, the authority to request food and medical aid passed to the next of kin, and for ten of the men, the next of kin acceded to the wish of the prisoner that he should die.

That strike was broken by families finally being persuaded to tell the hunger strikers that they would act against their wishes. The prisoners bonded closely. They lived with the absence of all privacy, even for defecation, masturbation and prayer. This was comparable to the filth and closeness of the First World War trenches and the Nazi prison camps. Those who had endured this appear to have been bonded for life, remember each other with unabashed love and even reverence.

But when camaraderie is bound by loyalties that are militarily underwritten; disloyalty is punishable by military means, often by execution, and with the endorsement of the other comrades.

But how conducive can a military comradeship be to the expression of emotion and honest vulnerability? You would have to be in the foxhole with a man to know. The men who shared cells in the H Blocks and smeared the walls around them with their own excrement appear to have stayed loyal to each other since. Those who have fallen out of the political structures appear also to have retained some friendships among former comrades but clearly have had problems retaining the respect of others.

Some indeed made strong friendships among Loyalist ex prisoners, former enemies, on the ground of shared experience of prison.

Comradeship demands loyalty to a shared narrative of experience.

This narrative binds the past and the future. It is a narrative which defines the enemy and endorses the steps taken against the enemy.

Former IRA prisons press officer, Richard O'Rawe, was torn between loyalties to the cause and to his comrades, when he saw a conflict between them. He said that he would not have broken from the strategy of the republican movement for managing the hunger strike, but felt later that he owed a loyalty of friendship to the men who lived through it to give a fuller account of how the negotiations with the British had been managed and to express his own doubts about decisions taken by the IRA leadership. In a sense, his book *Blanketmen*, ends where it starts, with O'Rawe reflecting on whether he was really a good soldier at all. Friendship, as distinct from comradeship, should be forgiving and allow for the sharing of private feelings and fears? In an army you express your doubts only to seek support in overcoming them.

In friendship, doubt is aired to open the possibility of change. You don't expect a best friend to urge you to stay in a job or a marriage you are unhappy in; you expect him – we are talking about men here – to help you explore imaginatively the prospect of getting out

However, ordinary friendship may never, or at least only rarely, reach this intensity of belonging to each other that soldiers at war feel. Friends

go to each other's family funerals, perhaps even weep together, but not in a sustained rapture of connectedness lasting weeks and months and years.

And other arenas of male bonding, from the schoolyard to the football terraces seem to follow the camaraderie model, which imposes uniformity and discipline. Men weep for their team, speak to each other of the love and concern for the team in a way which those who don't share those emotions feel excluded from.

Football fandom draws from the intensity of the charge of emotion that comes from being part of a huge crowd held in suspense through a game. It includes the same separation of men from women, the same attachment to territory, the same respect for manly physical endurance as does war.

If we are to think of an image of non-sexual intimacy between men, we will probably visualise the antics of footballers round one who has just scored a goal. They will hug and jump on each other, tousle the hair of the scorer, pile on top of him, run wild in circles, arms in the air, leaping with glee. And it will come easy to tens of thousands watching, to spiritually join in.

This may be closer to Durkheim's description of religious conduct than most of what happens in church these days, but it is not friendship because it allows of no doubt. A Celtic supporter doesn't ever say: ‘och maybe Rangers deserve to win this year’.

Honesty brings in contention but friendship is about the management of that contention. Camaraderie is about denying it. Camaraderie focuses on goals, literal and metaphorical goals, shared victories. It says there is a place for fretting about your marriage and this isn't it.

And if honest friendship is difficult within a camaraderie model, how much is it possible across the boundaries of a conflict? Strangely, there is much militaristic literature celebrating the respect of the soldier for the enemy. British evaluations of the IRA often remarked on the higher professional standards of the IRA than of other similar paramilitary groups, almost to the point of suggesting that greater competence in an army suggests a greater merit in the cause it is fighting for.

Soldiering is ostensibly done to protect our people from an enemy, but the ideals of soldiering represent a higher value than the family values we are defending, or believe we are defending, when we go to war. There are indications of this throughout the mythology of war, say, in the narrative poetry that British and Irish schoolboys were taught to learn by heart.

Rudyard Kipling is a fine example of a chauvinistic writer celebrating militaristic values. In his poem The Ballad of East and West, an English soldier and an Indian recognise heroism in each other and defer to it. War will divide them, they know, but they will part from this encounter holding

each other in the highest esteem. Indeed Kamal and the Colonel's son, once they have decided not to kill each other, seek to outdo each other in gifts.

> They have looked each other between the eyes, and there they have found no fault.
> They have taken the oath of brother in blood on leavened bread and salt:
> They have taken the oath of Brother in Blood on fire and fresh cut sod,
> On the hilt and the haft of the Khyber knife and the Wondrous names of God.

This camaraderie that crosses enemy lines is a recurring theme in British narrative heroic poetry.

It is in Thomas Babington Macaulay's “Horatius”. This poem, like Kipling's is written to a march beat, presumably in the hope that men would march to war with the words of it in their heads. Lars Porsena of Clusium has sworn by the nine gods that the great house of Tarquin will suffer no further insult from Rome and has gathered a great army, but it has been stopped at a bridge over the river Tiber, defended only by three men, Horatius and two others.

Horatius - his two sidekicks defeated now - commits his body to the Tiber and plunges into the water rather than surrender,

> No sound of joy or sorrow
> Was heard from either bank:
> But friends and foes in dumb surprise,
> With parted lips and straining eyes,
> Stood gazing where he sank;
> And when above the surges
> They saw his crest appear,
> All Rome sent forth a rapturous cry,
> And even the ranks of Tuscany
> Could scarce forebear to cheer.

Walt Whitman, who nursed injured soldiers during the American civil war, idealised comradeship as the highest love between men.

> Only I will establish in Manhattan and in every city of these states inland and seaboard,
> And in fields and woods, and above every keel little or large that dents the water,
> Without edifices or rules or trustees or any argument,
> The institution of the dear love of comrades.

This is comradeship presented as the wholesome natural life. It is something beyond the military life, a vision of swarthy young men in the outdoors, finding support and consolation in each other and unrestrained and unlimited love. The suggestion here is of comradeship as homosexual love, stated about as plainly as was possible in the nineteenth century.

While this is perhaps a quite beautiful image of human bonding, it has the shared characteristic of comradeship in other contexts, it is between men; it has nothing to do with family and women, it even elevates the love between men to being the foundation of domestic life.

Certainly, military comradeship produces a far more intense bonding than is normally found between friends, probably more intense even than is found between lovers. But friendship is something else. It is, or aspires to being, a relationship in which honest vulnerability and concern are expressed and supported. A friend is someone who can accept your need to know yourself, someone who, in sharing experiences with you grows wiser too.

Comrades share a world to the exclusion of the demands on the wider affective personality. It is the exclusion of the concerns of others, particularly of women, that makes their work together possible, but it is primarily a working relationship, an engagement with a task rather than a meeting of minds that are free to open fully to each other.

Those who give themselves to a martial culture may turn out to be so much like those they face in battle that they have a very short distance to cross to understand them. What of those who are not inducted into martial culture? Can people in tribes in conflict, but not bound to martial values, or the unconditional defence of the tribe, ever be friends?

Friendships across boundaries, if they can be attempted, are potentially strong and valuable friendships if they do more of what all friendships do; make you safe to doubt how you habitually think and react. The danger is that they become restrained and limited by civilities and preferred ignorance.

Real friendship rests on the things that soldiers don't share - as soldiers - but share only as people, and those things often conflict with soldiering and its bonding forces. The real conversation between foes must take place between civilians, people with civic and familial human concerns around which trusting and understanding relationships can deepen.

What strengthens such friendships? The need to explain positions, to help the other comprehend one's own 'side'.

And that's what you would expect: i.e., that those who transgress the limits of factional living learn more about others and about themselves and

become better people, more capable of understanding others and, therefore, of befriending them.

CHAPTER TWO

THE SONGS OF YOURS AND MINE:[1] THE POWER OF PERFORMANCE AND TECHNIQUES OF PERSUASION IN POLITICAL SONG

JAIME ROLLINS MCCOLGAN

The Irish revolutionary James Connolly once wrote that "until the [social] movement is marked by the joyous, defiant singing of revolutionary songs, it lacks one of the most distinctive marks of a popular revolutionary movement; it is the dogma of the few and not the faith of the multitude" (1907). Mary King, an activist in the student wing of the American civil rights protest, remarked that the freedom songs sung at demonstrations "had an unparalleled ability to evoke the moral power of the movement's goals, to arouse the spirit, comfort the afflicted, instil courage and commitment, and to unite disparate strangers into a 'band of brothers and sisters' and a 'circle of trust'".[2]

What these two quotes have at their heart is the recognition of the power of music to move, influence, educate, inspire and, above all, to unite people, especially in times of social upheaval. Music's ability to communicate across barriers and gloss over subtle differences makes it ideal as a device to gain or sustain support for social movements.

---

[1] From the Irish rebel song "Let the People Sing", composer unknown: "Let the people sing the stories and their songs/ the music of their native land/ the lullabies and battle cries and songs of hope and joy/ join us hand in hand/ all across this ancient land, throughout the test of time/ it was music that kept the spirit free/ the songs of yours and of mine."

[2] Quoted in Ron Eyerman and Andrew Jamison, *Music and social movements: Mobilizing traditions in the twentieth century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 1998), 45.

Ethnomusicologist Christopher Small writes that in playing music, we establish

> a set of relationships, and it is in those relationships that the meaning of the act lies. They are to be found not only between those organised sounds[…]but also between the people who are taking part, in whatever capacity, in the performance; and they model, or stand as a metaphor for, ideal relationships as the participants in the performance imagine them to be; relationships between person and person, between individual and society, between humanity and the natural world and even perhaps the supernatural world.[3]

Music is an important part of our everyday life. It can forge bonds or erect boundaries. It is not remarkable that music and the politics of social change should engage with one another, or that one might be used to promote, manipulate, or influence the other. In this paper I will explore the power of music, and the role it performs in motivating, unifying, and driving social movements and political reform. In Northern Ireland, the music of the republican movement both reinforces belonging and alienates those who do not belong, or those who oppose. The songs give expression to the people's emotions and remind them that past struggles are not new, nor are they alone, and in some cases, that the struggle has not yet been won.

Social Movements and Music

The definition of a social movement is a complicated one, for its interpretation is not bound how many people participate, its successes or failures, or its popularity. The definition I prefer interprets social movements as "central moments in the reconstitution of culture. In the creative turmoil that is unleashed within social movements, modes of cultural action are redefined and given new meaning as sources of collective identity".[4] I have chosen to apply the concept of a social movement to republicanism in Northern Ireland because in the face of Northern Ireland's changing politics, this constant, though not always unified, campaign has remained a driving force. What began as an uprising and turned into a civil war then calmed after the inauguration of the Irish Free State, but the ardour for a thirty-two county state did not fade away

[3] Christopher Small, *Musicking: The meaning of performing and listening.* Middletown (CT: Wesleyan University Press, 1998), 13.
[4] Eyerman and Jamison, *Music and social movements*, 6.

completely. It stayed simmering below the surface and eventually came to a head at the outbreak of the Troubles. It now resides in the hearts and minds–and the songs–of Irish republicans.

Zimmerman, a theorist on the songs of Irish rebellion, postulates that Irish political songs were originally a form of street ballad and were composed and sung mainly to convey popular opinion and news, especially to illiterate audiences. The songs, written to be sung out in the streets, contained basic and sometimes crude lyrics, but they tapped into fundamental emotions that were easily understood by the population. The songs were–and still are–"effective in shaping a common memory of events and binding the Irish together".[5] This accounts for the popularity of the music with the community generations later. Eyerman and Jamison have written that "[…]in social movements, musical and other kinds of cultural traditions are made and remade, and after the movements fade away as political forces, the music remains as a memory and as a potential way to inspire new waves of mobilization".[6] And this is the case in Ireland: music about the 1798, 1803, 1848, 1867, and 1916 revolts continue to be sung with passion and affection. As one musician told me, "If you can instil a thought in someone's head with the song that will change their opinion or make them read something, that will maybe change their [mind] to participate in where we're trying to go politically".[7]

In Denisoff's study of protest and revolutionary music, he divides the songs into two categories based on their role in conveying dissent.[8] The first category is "magnetic" songs, which use repeating chords that are straightforward and catchy to encourage audience participation. The use of recurring melodies makes them easier to remember and maximises comprehension of the message. The lyrics are central to the songs, and, in Irish ballads, McCann postulates that the chorus is a relatively recent invention to promote audience interaction.[9] Denisoff's second category of protest song is the "rhetorical". These songs concentrate on individual sufferings, or they place the protest in the abstract. The technical competency of the music and the musician come before the lyrics, and the songs may vent frustration and anger but offer no real solution to the

[5] Georges Denis Zimmerman, 2nd ed., *Songs of Irish rebellion: Irish political street ballads and rebel songs, 1780 – 1900* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2002), 10.
[6] Eyerman and Jamison, *Music and social movements*, 1-2.
[7] C., in interview, 07/06.
[8] Quoted in Eyerman and Jamison, *Music and social movements*, 37-40.
[9] May McCann, "The past in the present: A study of some aspects of the politics of music in Belfast" (PhD thesis, Queen's University Belfast, Belfast, 1985), 217.

problem. While these categories are useful for separating the "rally" songs from those that merely relate stories or events, these groupings are based primarily on the music's function.

Mattern has also analysed forms of music stemming from community-based political action. His division of the songs into three categories (confrontational, deliberative, and pragmatic) takes into account broader aspects of musicality. The confrontational form contains protest music and is used to voice ideals and concerns of a group whose politics are in opposition to another group or groups. It may offer a solution or it may simply proclaim the virtues of the desired way of life. Mattern writes:

> Community members use this confrontational form of acting in concert to enlist sympathy and support for the claims of their community, to draw attention to their concerns, and to assure that the interests of their community takes precedence over the interests of other communities. [10]

In my own research, most of the Irish political ballads commending "hero-martyrs" would fall into this category,[11] for while they list the sufferings of the community, they praise those who sacrificed their lives in order to improve the future for younger generations. In many songs, the blame is placed firmly on the opposition: in this case, the British, and by extension, those who identify as British (namely the majority of the loyalist/unionist Protestant community).

Mattern's second category is described as *deliberative*, and it "occurs when members of a community use musical practices to debate their identity and commitments or when members of different communities negotiate mutual relations".[12] While both confrontational and deliberative forms of music stem from a base of divergent ideas, ideals, and identities within communities, this form is more actively involved in negotiation and exploration. The music creates a forum for debate to determine who we are and who we are not, what is accepted and what will not be tolerated. In Northern Ireland, cross-community groups have on occasion used music to bridge community interaction: workshops on the Lambeg drum and the bodhrán ensure that both traditions are learned and respected for the

[10] Mark Mattern, *Acting in concert: Music, community and political action* (New Brunswick, New Jersey: Rutgers University Press: 1998), 25.
[11] McCann, "The past in the present"; Jaime Rollins, "Tiocfiadh ar lá! Sing up the RA!': Rebel songs of Northern Irish republicanism" (MA thesis, Queen's University Belfast, Belfast, 2006).
[12] Mattern, *Acting in concert*, 28.

differences in texture and sound that they bring to the music.[13] Engaging in the music of another group offers a window of insight into the group's values and beliefs and could eventually lead to understanding.

The *pragmatic* form moves towards acceptance and music is used to promote similar interests and cooperation within the community. It allows and even encourages diversity and an element of respect for individuals' differences. An example might be the surge in fusion bands springing up in cities where there has been an increase in diversity. The music acknowledges influences in the community by incorporating elements of musical diversity. Ironically, Irish folk music is saturated with this kind of integration in almost every respect *but* from what is popularly seen as deriving from the Protestant traditions, like fifes and the Lambeg drum. Many Irish musicians record traditional music with mandolins and mandolas, banjos, bazoukis, djembes and mountain dulcimers, or bring exotic instruments along to sessions.[14] The pragmatic form does not just encompass fusion music, but can also be used to express particular facets of identities or to highlight certain elements of culture. A festival celebration of Native American identity might mean several bands play songs unique to their tastes and styles; pop musicians might appeal for greater environmental awareness; country-and-western singers might accentuate a lonely and difficult lifestyle within a greater community. It is possible that it will be this category in which Irish political ballads eventually settle, that they might cease to be seen as confrontational or sectarian and simply become a testament to the feelings and sentiments felt by the nationalist community during a particular period of their history.

Techniques of Persuasion

When I began the research for my Masters dissertation two years ago, one of the questions at the forefront of my mind was how Irish rebel music came to hold so much power in a community, especially for younger generations who grew up in times of relative peace. Attending as many concerts as I did, it was apparent that these songs held immense significance

[13] Roy Arbuckle, "Different Drums: A study of a cultural animation project in Northern Ireland" (M.Sc Thesis, University of Ulster, Magee College, 2003).

[14] Martin Stokes, "Place, exchange, and meaning: Black Sea musicians in the west of Ireland," in *Ethnicity, identity, and music: The musical construction of place*, ed. Martin Stokes (Oxford: Berg, 1997), 97-116.

for not only the nationalist/republican population, but Scottish, American, Latin American, Native American, Catalan and Basque aficionados were also often present, and many of them were familiar with the music. On the Internet, websites abound with Irish rebel music's 'top-ten' rated ballads.

To answer my question of how these songs capture the passions, values and beliefs of republicanism, I looked at the techniques of persuasion–outlined briefly below–used in the songs to reconfirm commitment, influence the unsure, and educate the young.[15] I established four categories in which most, if not all, of the songs could fall under. These techniques are intended to maximise the impact these songs have on potential listeners, and although I am using the example of Irish rebel music with themes that are best recognised by Irish nationalists and republicans, the techniques themselves are not exclusive to Irish rebel music. Taken out of context, many of the songs used in political struggles all over the world could fall into one or more of these categories. These techniques are used by songwriters to reaffirm commitment to the cause and to uphold the validity of historical truths perceived by the community.

The first technique uses historical perspective to preserve continuity and provide background for the struggle. Ireland as a whole has been marked by periods of struggle that have given rise to a large body of music casting the events, heroes and villains into the minds of the people via song. Historical memory plays a big part in how the past is recalled, especially when it comes to British mistakes and the Irish tragedies that came about because of those mistakes. It matters not so much that what is remembered is accurate or inaccurate with accordance of the facts; what matters is that the people remember the event (or the person) in a particular light, and it is this perception they will relate in the retelling of the story. Kammen has put it thusly: "what people believe to be true about their past is usually more important in determining their behaviour and responses than the truth itself".[16] Although this comment was not made with Northern Ireland in mind, it is an apt description of how perceived injustice can still thrive among the generations who have actually witnessed very little in the large scope of the Troubles. And, to follow on with a point Connerton has made, we "preserve versions of the past by representing it to ourselves in words and images", and, I must certainly add, in music.[17]

---

[15] For a full explanation and analysis, see Rollins, "Tiocfiadh ar lá!".

[16] Quoted in Caroline Bithell, "Introduction: The past in music," *Ethnomusicology Forum* 15, no. 1 (2006): 5.

[17] Paul Connerton, *How societies remember* (Cambridge: Cambridge University