Missionary Work in Africa in Eugène Casalis's Time and Beyond

Missionary Work in Africa in Eugène Casalis's Time and Beyond

Edited by

Jamary Molumeli and Michel Prum

Missionary Work in Africa in Eugène Casalis's Time and Beyond

Edited by Jamary Molumeli and Michel Prum

This book first published 2015

Cambridge Scholars Publishing

Lady Stephenson Library, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE6 2PA, UK

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION:
RACE AND RELIGION

This book consists of a selection of papers that were presented at the international colloquium on "Eugène Casalis: Missions and Colonialism" which was held at Morija, in Lesotho, from the 29th to the 31st of October 2012. The event was the initiative of the Research Team on Eugenics and Racism (GRER) of the University of Paris Diderot. It was hosted by our colleagues of the National University of Lesotho who, in their own wisdom, translated the theme to read "Missionary Work in Eugène Casalis's Time and beyond". I would like to thank them and their good University for agreeing to co-organize this international event. It was a privilege for us to participate in a conference in Lesotho, the second home of Eugène Casalis. This was, as far as I know, the first international conference co-organised in Lesotho by a French university.

The idea of this conference on Eugène Casalis and the link between missions and colonialism dates back to 2010 when a conference on "*Métissages*" was held in Cape Town, South Africa, co-organized by the *Alliance Française* of Cape Town and my research group, the GRER.

I would like to "render unto Caesar the things that belong to Caesar." It is our colleague, Dr. Marie-Claude Mosimann-Barbier, who had the brilliant idea of commemorating the bicentenary of Casalis's birth by holding a conference in the place where he set up his very first mission; namely, at Morija, in Lesotho. It was largely thanks to her tremendous energy, great devotion and determination that the conference was successfully held at the appropriate time; that is in 2012, the year that marks the bicentenary.

It was not easy to co-organise the scientific event at such a long distance, but Dr. Barbier spent considerable time getting in touch with all the important people in Lesotho, in France and elsewhere. She was, at the end of the day, successful in convincing everyone that this was the event to realize. She therefore deserves our deepest gratitude: Thank you very much, Marie-Claude!

I would like to introduce my research team, the GRER. It is a team within the research unit called "Identities, Cultures, Territories", an official research organ recognised by the French Ministry of Higher

Education and Research. In this unit, there are French historians of all periods and specialists in several study areas, particularly studies focused on issues pertaining to the English-speaking World, which includes South Africa and Lesotho. The GRER is manned predominantly by specialists in study areas in the English speaking World. Founded in 1998, this unit deals mainly with issues of racism and race and, to a lesser extent, the question of eugenics.

The word 'race' is no longer used in France. It was dropped at the end of World War Two because it was associated with the Nazi Germany. As one would note, France was occupied for several years by the latter and thus experienced racial exclusion laws against the Jews.

The concept of race is also totally irrelevant from a scientific point of view. Scientific breakthroughs in the late 20th Century have shown that there are no differences between "Whites" and "Blacks" if one takes into consideration the DNA of those groups. For instance, a White person may be much closer to a Black person in terms of the DNA than it could be the case between two White persons or two Black. Therefore, using the colour of the skin as a criterion to categorise human groups is totally arbitrary. Otherwise, if it were that easy, one could simply use the colour of the hair or the shape and size of the ear to determine one's race. Academics in the English speaking World know these breakthroughs, of course, but they keep on using the word 'race' for the sake of convenience. For example, Britain and the United States of America have never been occupied by the Nazis and, as a result, they have no knee-jerk reaction against the word "race". Such phrases as "race relations" are common talk in Britain or the United States. Their equivalent would be unthinkable in the rhetoric of the French speaking World. I do use the word 'race' in this introduction, but the reader should bear in mind that it only refers to the perception of groups by other groups, not to a real natural categorisation.

Religion has always been used by human beings in their debate on race either to justify or to fight against racism. In the Christian world, as this conference was about Christian missions in Africa, people have turned to the Bible to defend their points of view. One good example in this regard is the reference made to the Bible in the famous historical controversy concerning race and humankind. As one would note, a long historical polemic opposed the advocates of polygenesis, who believed in separate ancestors for the different 'races' of humankind, and monogenists who held that the human race was one and came from one common stock. The traditional view of the Christian Church was clearly monogenic. Humankind was one, as every human creature descended from the original couple, Adam and Eve. Therefore, despite any differences and possible

inequalities, one thing remained certain: we all belonged to the same family.

With the advent of the 18th century and the Age of Enlightenment, there emerged another opposing force whereby some philosophers chose to attack the church by contesting the monogenic thought. The most illustrative case in this regard is that of Voltaire. This French philosopher would do anything, anytime, anywhere to offend the Church. He was a staunch supporter of polygenetic theses. In his *Essai sur les mœurs et l'esprit des nations* (1756), Voltaire devotes an entire chapter to "The Different Races of Man". For instance, he advances that:

> Only a blind man can doubt that the Whites, the Negroes, the Albinos, the Hottentots, the Laps, the Chinese, the Americans, are totally different races[1].

However, this controversy was complex in that it did not clearly distinguish the defenders from the opponents of the Church. For instance, not all polygenesis subscribers were anti-Church like Voltaire. A considerable number of polygenists supported the Church and were opposed to the idea of the unity of humankind based on religion. They supported their view by referring to the Bible, citing, in particular, the Genesis chapter, whereby Cain, after slaying Abel, answers to the Lord who has condemned him to being 'a fugitive and a vagabond': "it shall come to pass that everyone who findeth me shall slay me"[2]. If "everyone" could threaten Cain, one can therefore argue that there was certainly someone else on earth at that time, apart from Adam and Eve's offspring. Therefore, polygenists argue further that the Bible itself bears testimony to the existence of other races.

Such speculations on the existence of pre-Adamite tribes are to be found as early as the Middle Ages in the three religions of the Book. In the 16th and 17th Centuries, polygenetic views were further upheld by such famous intellectuals as Giordano Bruno in Italy and Isaac de La Peyrère in France. Though Genesis was used to exclude part of the world population from humankind, I would like to say that racists and white supremacists would be ill-advised to turn to the Bible to support their views. The Bible never showed any sign of disrespect for a particular race. One issue has often been raised to support the view that the Bible was, at least once,

---

[1] Voltaire, *Essai sur les mœurs et l'esprit des nations* (1756), Chapter 2 ; My translation.
[2] Genesis: 4, 14; King James's version.

"racist". It is contained in an extract from the Song of Songs. In the Song of Solomon I: 5, one can read: "I am dark but beautiful". King James Bible reads: "I am black, but comely". There are also versions such as: "I am black but lovely" or "Dark am I, yet lovely". The question is, of course, why "but"? Why "yet"? Why are beauty and blackness opposed? Some modern commentators have argued that the Bible was somewhat biased in this regard.

Notwithstanding the foregoing, it can be observed that the original Greek text reads: "*Melain eimi kai kale*". The Greek word *kai* has two meanings: it may mean "but"; it may also mean "and". There is, therefore, an option to express some degree of contrast in beauty.

Furthermore, the Bible was also wrongfully used to justify slavery and the slave trade. Once again, reference was made to the Genesis chapter: Noah had three sons; namely, Sem, Japheth and Ham. As he lay drunk and naked, Ham saw him. Ham called his brothers. These ones came walking backward so as not to see their naked father and covered him with a garment. When he woke up, he cursed Canaan, Ham's son. He was condemned to be 'the lowest of slaves' and so were to be his offspring. Therefore, some commentators have advanced that the slavery of the black human race originates from and was legitimised by the Holy Book.

Nonetheless, there is no specific reference in Genesis to Ham being black. It is only at the end of the Middle Ages that Ham was "ethnicised" together with his brothers. Ham became black, Japheth white and Sem was supposed to have fathered the Semite race. In the 15th Century, the Portuguese philosopher, Gomes Eanes de Zurara (1410-1474), was the first to link the slave trade to the Curse of Ham. According to Léon Poliakov (*Le Racisme*, 1976), the German scholar Georg Horn (1620-1670) was the first to propose the categorization of the human race according to Noah's three sons. He submitted such thesis in 1666 at the University of Leyden, in the Netherlands.

One can safely observe that all attempts to legitimise slavery and or colonisation with the support of the Bible were historical reinterpretations which read into the Bible elements of race segregation which simply did not exist in the original texts of the Book.

Michel PRUM

Research Team on Eugenics and Racism

University of Denis Diderot

Sorbonne Paris Cité

MISSION EDUCATION AND THE EVANGELICAL MISSIOLOGY OF JAMES STEWART IN LOVEDALE

CLAIRE KACZMAREK

Whether regarded as a hero or despised as a colonial coercive agent, the Scottish missionary, Dr. James Stewart (1831-1905), made a major contribution to education in South Africa and, as a result, his "name [is] still synonymous with African education"[1].

Born in Edinburgh, James Stewart had a Presbyterian education, first, in the Church of Scotland, the Kirk, and second, in the Free Church of Scotland, the Free Kirk. He studied theology at New College in 1855 and in 1859 he enrolled for medicine at the University of Edinburgh. When he was a student, he was a great admirer of David Livingstone and was consequently nicknamed "Africa Stewart" or "Stewart Africanus"[2]. From 1862 to 1864, he joined David Livingstone's Zambezi Expedition to Central Africa. This practical exposure was considered to be Stewart's "apprenticeship"[3]. Afterwards, he returned to Scotland to complete his medical studies in Glasgow in 1866. He was, a year earlier, ordained minister of the Free Church of Scotland and was, after graduation, considered by the church to have a particularly useful experience in spreading Christianity on the "Dark Continent", that is, Africa, as he called it.

In 1867, Stewart joined the staff of Lovedale Institution situated near Alice in the Cape Colony. Although Lovedale became the main educational mission-station where James Stewart toiled, his assignments were not confined to Lovedale. For instance, he made a considerable contribution to the development of the mission-station of Blythswood in

---

[1] Jane Starfield, *Dr S. Modiri Molema (1891-1965): The Making of a Historian*, Ph. D Thesis, University of the Witwatersrand, 2007, p. 178.

[2] James Wells, *Dr. Stewart of Lovedale: the Life of James Stewart*, New York Chicago, Fleming H. Revell, 1909, pp. 21-22.

[3] *Ibid.* p. 81.

1873, which was nicknamed *"The Child of Lovedale"* in Transkei, South South Africa. He also founded the Livingstonia Station as tribute to David Livingstone who was in Malawi, in 1874.

"*Hoping for a Kenyan Lovedale*", the Imperial British East Africa Company, invited James Stewart to do pioneering work in Kenya among the Kikuyu[4].

Given that "Lovedale was one of the leading missionary educational institutions of sub-Saharan Africa, opened by Scottish missionaries in 1841"[5], and that the mission gave an impetus for further educational developments as stated previously, the present study explores Stewart's interventions in Lovedale and the role of the seminary in the formation of colonial society in South Africa. First and foremost, an analysis of James Stewart's Presbyterian education and the Scottish ecclesiastical and social context will demonstrate the significance of Scottish Presbyterian education and its impact on the curriculum in Lovedale. Secondly, a study on the educational mission at Lovedale, which is built on the solid foundations of the Scottish Presbyterian model, will investigate the continuity and the limits of the Presbyterian ideal in the context of colonial expansion in Africa. Lastly, I will discuss the Lovedale educational system as a model for missions and how it was incorporated into the framework of the science of missiology.

The sources of Stewart's educational system:
Scottish Presbyterianism and education

As a Presbyterian, James Stewart was deeply influenced by the Church's ethos, in particular, by the Presbyterian tradition of a "Godly Commonwealth"[6]. In the vision of a "Godly Commonwealth", the Church of Scotland would expand across the World by transforming individuals within the community. According to the biblical principles, instruction and moral education remained central to this ambitious project of reforming

---

[4] Bengt Sundkler and Christopher Steed, *A History of the Church in South Africa,* Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2000, p. 557.

[5] T. Jack Thompson, *Capturing the Image: African Missionary Photography as Enslavement and Liberation*, Day Associates Lecture, June 29, 2007, Yale University Divinity School, New Haven, CT, the Yale Divinity School Library, http://www.library.yale.edu/div/pub/CapturingtheImage.pdf, p. 7.

[6] Stewart J. Brown defined the Godly Commonwealth as: "A world-affirming and revolutionary faith, which sought to penetrate every aspect of social, political, and economic life." In Brown, J. S., *Thomas Chalmers and the Godly Commonwealth*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1982, p. XV.

the individuals as well as the society. Since the epoch of the Scottish Reformation, education constituted the first mission of the Kirk. The Scottish Reformer, John Knox, had an educational plan for Scotland and beyond.

In one of the main documents of the Reformation, *The First Book of Discipline (1560),* the authors make reference to ecclesiastical policy and discipline and recommend that there should be one school and one schoolmaster for each congregation or parish in Scotland:

> […] Of necessity therefore we judge it, that every several church has a schoolmaster appointed, such a one as is able, at least, to teach grammar and the Latin tongue, if the town is of any reputation[7].

All in all, the Reformers desired to implement universal education in order to propagate the Gospel, settle the reformation throughout Scotland and provide education for the ministry. This ideal was further raised in *The Second Book of Discipline (1578)*[8].

The vision on universal education translated into reality in the late 18th and early 19th century when the humble peasantry and future ministers were able to attend the local parish school. Although the egalitarian myth remains a topic for discussion up until today, Scottish education was considered to have reached remarkable standards and was hailed throughout Europe. Furthermore, one would note that the Kirk contributed enormously to the development of the myth of the "Lad o' Pairts" and this was mainly due to the promotion of the ideal of a school in every parish. The myth provides that:

> The boy (though not the girl), had been able, no matter the economic circumstances of his parents, to gain within the parish school of the Presbyterian system the advanced schooling necessary for admission to one of Scotland's four also 'democratic' universities[9].

The myth has been nurtured by some vivid illustrations such as the reputation of David Livingstone (1813-1873), who gained a resonance beyond the national borders. As a textile worker in a Blantyre cotton mill, he became one of the first medical missionaries to explore central and

---

[7] *The First Book of Discipline*, 1560 : http://www.swrb.com
[8] Nigel Cameron (Ed.), *Dictionary of Scottish Church History and Theology*, Edinburgh: Intervarsity Press, 1993, pp.765-766.
[9] Callum G. Brown, *Religion and Society in Scotland since 1707*, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1997, p. 183.

southern Africa[10]. According to Esther Breitenbach, Livingstone was indeed a Congregationalist; but what mattered most to the British readership was that the explorer was Scottish and Christian[11]. As time went by, Scottish missionary tradition thrived on missionary literature and thus concealed dogmatic differences to highlight the following trinity: education, Presbyterianism and Scottishness. Stewart was the typical Victorian who epitomised this tradition.

More significant in the career of James Stewart was the foundation of the Free Church of Scotland in 1843. The Stewarts left the national Church to adhere to the Free Kirk. His father became an Elder of the newly-created denomination and often lent his barn for Church services in the wake of the "Disruption". Preceded by the Ten Years' Conflict, the third Scottish Reformation corresponded to the secession of over 450 ministers from the Established Church. The circumstances which led to the schism were a clear assertion of a spiritual independence of the Church from the encroachment of the State in the spiritual affairs. Holding to the Free Church principles was synonymous with an outstanding sacrifice because the new adherents had to abandon all their belongings to the Established Church.

Under the leadership of the Evangelical, Thomas Chalmers (1787-1846), the Free Church was deprived of churches, manses, glebes, stipends and schools. It had to fund its edification through the relentless efforts of its members. Not only were the outgoing Ministers, Elders, Deacons and their families victims of the "Disruption" during the initial years of difficulties, but so were the 408 schoolmasters who were laid off for having expressed their approval of the Free Church principles[12].

Whereas the "Disruption" was an emblem of spiritual split and financial poverty, the separation gave a tremendous evangelical impetus to revive the reformed ideal of the "Godly Commonwealth" and the revitalisation of the parochial system with a church and a school in every parish. An ambitious scheme for education, which was funded entirely by voluntary contributions, was implemented for the building of 500 parochial schools and a Free Church College in Edinburgh. Instead of

---

[10] B. W. Lloyd and J. Lashbrook, *A bibliography of published works by and about David Livingstone, 1843-1975,* edited and completed by T. A. Simons Cape Town: University of Cape Town Libraries, 1978.

[11] Esther Breitenbach, *The Influence of the Missionary Movement in Scotland,* Economic and Social Research Council, Lecture, October 1st, 2008: http://www.esrc.ac.uk.

[12] Stewart J. Brown, *Thomas Chalmers and the Godly Commonwealth*, Oxford University Press, 1982, p. 342.

fading away, the myth of the "democratic intellect" was revived by the newly-founded Free Kirk in 1843.

The Free Church zeal and enthusiasm grew throughout the Empire. Home as well as foreign missions had already been a central pillar in Thomas Chalmers' vision of a "Godly Commonwealth" before the "Disruption". In 1822, the missionary ideal was epitomised by the fruitful combination of education, missions and the Bible:

> There never was an age of the world in which a more effective machinery
> of conversion was, in the shape of schools, and Bibles, and missionaries,
> put into operation[13].

As a Professor of Moral Philosophy at the University of Saint Andrews, Thomas Chalmers trained students for foreign missions. These students were members of the University Missionary Association, which was founded in 1824. From the student association there emerged the so called "Saint Andrews Seven", among who figured Alexander Duff, who played a major role in the development of Western education in India, from 1830 throughout the rise of the Scottish missionary movement[14].

While missions had been under the management of the London Missionary Society, the Edinburgh Missionary Society and the Glasgow Missionary Society, the 1824 General Assembly of the Church of Scotland appointed a committee for a Church mission to India. From 1843, the missionary landscape changed tremendously as the Free Church became increasingly active in the mission field, extending its schemes to Africa, Asia and Oceania. The focus of the Free Church on mission resulted in "one of the largest missionary organisations in the world"[15].

At time of the "Disruption", many of the members of the Established Church of Scotland's mission adhered to the Free Church, thus creating denominational havoc across the Empire. As the "Disruption" caused divisions beyond national borders, the Free Church soon transferred its education ethos to overseas missions, placing education as a traditional mainstay of Scottish missions.

In the wake of the "Disruption", "work" became the main feature of the Free Kirk. Remaining faithful to Chalmers, who called for extensive work to start and develop the Free Kirk—"*Work, Work, and Work*"—

---

[13] William Hannah, *Memoirs of the Life and Writings of Thomas Chalmers*, Edinburgh, Thomas Constable, 1849-1852, vol. 2, p. 503.
[14] For the "Saint Andrews Seven", see Stuart Piggin and John Roxborogh, *The Saint Andrews Seven*, Edinburgh, The Banner of the Truth Trust, 1985.
15 Nigel Cameron, *Ibid.* p. 337.

Stewart praised work as a virtue which belonged to the British race:

> The Gospel of work does not save souls, but it saves people. It is not a Christian maxim only, [namely,] that they who do not work should not eat; [but] it is also in the end a law of nature and of nations. Lazy races die or decay. Races that work prosper on the earth. The British race, in all its greatest branches, is noted for its restless activity. Its life motto is WORK! WORK! WORK! (Sic) And its deepest contempt is reserved for those who will not exert themselves[16].

The Free Church had an ambitious programme of education that re-emphasized the parish system of education, both at home and abroad. By founding the Free Church, Thomas Chalmers intended to carry on the project of a Godly Commonwealth in which instruction was the indispensable stepping-stone to moral education: "There is no controverting the existence of a moral sense in the rudest of the barbarians...in all countries you have ground upon which you can enter"[17].

Based upon universal education, Chalmers' views considered the Scottish model of the parochial system as perfectly transferable:

> If schools and Bible have been found to be the engines of civilisation it is altogether a fair and direct exercise when these schools and Bibles are counted upon as equally powerful engines of civilisation to the people of other countries[18].

As a Free Church minister and missionary, James Stewart intended to revive the Presbyterian parish system in Lovedale. His biographer testifies:

> As a lead-hearted son of John Knox, he wished to have church and school side by side, to provide a sound elementary education for all native children, and to make an open path from the school to the college within reach of every scholar 'of pregnant parts.' And he had the daring to plan all this for heathen Africa[19].

Applying a fundamental Church principle to a South African mission station, Stewart naturally asserted the inseparable bond between Scottish

---

[16] Jane Elizabeth Waterston, *The Letters of Jane Elizabeth Waterston*, 1866-1905, Cape Town, The Van Riebeeck Society, 1983, p. 6.

[17] Nigel Cameron, *Ibid.* p. 337.

[18] John Roxborogh, *Thomas Chalmers and the mission of the Church with special reference to the rise of the missionary movement in Scotland*, Ph. D. Thesis, University of Aberdeen, 1978, p. 298.

[19] James Wells, *Op. cit.* p.106.

mission and education: "Where the missionary goes, the school soon follows."[20]

The study of the Scottish Presbyterian culture, framework and faith of James Stewart has revealed that education, Presbyterianism and Scottish culture were intertwined in Scotland. The analysis also gave a glimpse of the influences which helped shape the development of Lovedale. The traditional Scottish educational system became a model that the missionaries were eager to monitor in the Empire. The Presbyterian-based egalitarian myth conveyed by national heroes and the creation of the Free Church of Scotland spurred the transference of the parish school system across the British Empire, especially via Scottish missionaries.

Reviving the Presbyterian Parish System in Lovedale: Presbyterian Ideal and cultural Constraints

This part of the present paper discusses the relevance of the approach presented here above in a South African context, through the case study of the mission-station of Lovedale.

Located near Alice, in the Eastern Cape, Lovedale was founded by Dr. John Love, under the management of the Glasgow Missionary Society, in 1824. Prior to the arrival of John Love, there had been earlier attempts to evangelise the Xhosa people of South Africa, notably through the work of John Brownlee of the London Missionary Society.

Two major events contributed to fashioning Lovedale. First, the station was repeatedly destroyed by the assaults of inter-tribal wars as well as conflicts between the Xhosa and the European settlers. Second, the 1843 "Disruption" had an impact on the Church of Scotland's missions in Africa. As a consequence, the home organisation, the Presbyterian Missions of the Scottish Church in South and Central Africa, split into "the Glasgow missionary society adhering to the Principles of the Church of Scotland" and "The Glasgow South African Missionary". The splits in the Church caused the transfer of almost the totality of the Church of Scotland's missionaries to the Free Church: "At the Disruption, all but one of the Church of Scotland missionaries went over to the new Free Church"[21]. Thus, Lovedale Missionary Institute became a Free Church mission station since the 1843 "Disruption".

---

[20] James Stewart, *Dawn in the Dark Continent or Africa and its Missions*, New York Chicago, Fleming H. Revell Company, 1903, p. 178.
[21] Hilary Mary Carey, *Empires of Religions*, Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan, 2008, p. 85.

Despite the ordeals, the mission station of Lovedale proved "the most important centre of African education in the southern hemisphere"[22]. The reputation of Lovedale was partly built upon the educational scheme of the Church of Scotland, which William Govan, the first Principal of Lovedale Seminary, put in place in 1841. In 1870, James Stewart replaced William Govan. It was in the wake of a disagreement that opposed Churchmen on educational and social grounds. Shepherd, the last ordained Principal of Lovedale makes the following comment:

> Govan was sacrificed because of his conviction that a primitive people could best be elevated first by the highest education of the few and Stewart took his place as Principal because he advocated first the elementary education of the many[23].

Many scholars tend to focus on James Stewart, ignoring the tremendous intervention by Govan, who was the first Principal and architect of the Seminary long before Stewart joined the staff of Lovedale.

While education methods could be a source of discussion and conflict within the mission community, disseminating the Gospel and Christianity throughout the world remained a shared assumption, albeit with tiny differences of opinion. Evangelising through education was the primary motivation of the missions because education was perceived as a stepping-stone to civilisation:

> Among peoples as those of the African continent, Christianity becomes the Universal Educator as well as civiliser, since civilisation starts and advances with education. Man cannot advance without the power to read[24].

In the 19th century educational missionary discourse, Christianity and civilisation were concepts which were commonly linked. James Stewart, who regarded Christianity as "the universal civiliser", illustrates this view as follows:

> And that is just what we labour for—a day in the future when the Dark Continent shall be a continent of light and progress, of cities and civilisation and Christianity[25].

---

[22] Gerald H. Anderson, *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Mission*, Grand Rapids / Cambridge, William B. Eerdmans Publishing, 1999, p. 288.
[23] R. Shepherd, *Lovedale, South Africa: 1824-1955*, Alice, Lovedale Press, 1971, p. 32.
[24] James Stewart, *Dawn in the Dark Continent, op. cit.* p. 179.
[25] James Stewart, *Lovedale: Past and Present*, Alice, Lovedale Mission Press,

While the fundamental role performed by education to simultaneously spread the Gospel and civilisation was widely recognised by all missionaries, the order in which the missionary had to prioritise Christianise and civilising was subject to turbulent discussions. The issue of whether evangelisation should be considered to be the source of civilisation or civilisation to be a precondition for evangelisation deeply divided the Evangelicals and the Moderates in the Church of Scotland in the first half of the 19th century[26]. The discrepancies were still vivid after the 1843 "Disruption", placing the debate between the Kirk and the Free Kirk.

As a Free Church missionary, James Stewart warned his acolytes that Christianising prevailed over civilising:

> Its chief aim, therefore, is not to civilise, but to Christianise. Merely to civilise can never be the primary aim of the missionary. Civilisation without Christianity among a savage people is a mere matter of clothes and whitewash. But among barbarous races a sound missionary method will in every way endeavour to promote civilisation by education and industry, resting on the solid foundation of religious instruction[27].

Underlying the process of converting the natives was the idea of transforming them according to the Victorian Scottish norm, which was based upon the combination of Presbyterian and Enlightenment principles.

As a student of the Church ministry, James Stewart attended courses in Moral Philosophy. He was therefore familiar with the Scottish philosophy of David Hume and Adam Smith, the founder of modern economics. He was also conversant with the Scottish Common-sense school of thought which counted, among others, Adam Ferguson, John Millar and Dugald Stewart, who all defined "The Natural History of mankind" through a close examination of History, represented as the gradual rise from barbarism to civilized society.

Although explaining the various tendencies involved in this conceptualisation is not the object of this paper, a brief overview of some of these philosophies could shed light on Stewart's missionary policy in Lovedale. Thus, while accusing the English of barbarism at times, David Hume also upheld the superiority of the Whites over other races. Unlike Hume, William Robertson, Moderate of the Church of Scotland, conceded that there were various stages in the long journey to civilisation.

1887, p. 21.

[26] Nigel Cameron, *Dictionary of Scottish Church History and Theology,* p. 569.

[27] James Stewart, *Lovedale,* p. 8.

Illustrating his thought by the example of the medieval Scottish epoch, which he equated to barbarism, Robertson assumed that Britain had attained a high degree of civilisation thanks to commerce. Admittedly, Stewart shared the Victorian assumption that the Europeans were superior to Africans. In the same manner as William Robertson, who perceived civilisation as gradually and unevenly attained, Stewart believed that a "high civilisation" had existed in Africa through the example and influence of Egypt, which he considered as the setting of Christianity[28]. The fall of the Egyptian civilisation was an omen of sin and punishment: "Non-Christian civilisations have come to grief and disappeared off the face of the earth for want of some essential moral element"[29]. An argument that could be interpreted as prone to justify both British imperialism and missionary activities was raised to say that, since Egypt could boast of being the setting for the history of Christianity, Africa ought to return to its Christian roots,.

Although an evangelical and Christ-centred missionary, Stewart seemed to side with the Moderate Robertson when it came to commerce. Under the traineeship of David Livingstone, who had argued that moral and material betterment of the Africans would be achieved by the combination of Christianity and legitimate commerce, Stewart developed Lovedale as an industrial mission.

For instance, while exploring Zambeziland, Stewart witnessed Swahili and Portuguese slave raiding and inter-tribal strife:

> [The Shiré Highlands] was a lonely land of barbarism, game and wild beasts, of timid and harried but not unkindly men, harassed by never-ending slave-raids and inter-tribal wars[30].

As a result of his exploration of Central Africa, Stewart's vision of missionary work was fashioned by "practical Christianity", an evangelical ethos developed by the abolitionist, William Wilberforce, and the philanthropist, Thomas Chalmers[31]. Both churchmen fought to alleviate the condition of the "invisible" human beings: the slaves and the paupers. "Practical" was Stewart's watchword:

---

[28] James Stewart, *Dawn in the Dark Continent, op.cit*, p. 11.
[29] *Ibid.* p. 27.
[30] James Wells, *Stewart of Lovedale*, *op.cit*. p.73.
[31] The Parliamentarian Wilberforce campaigned against the slave trade and slavery until the law was passed in 1833. Thomas Chalmers reorganised the parish system in the poorest areas of Glasgow and Edinburgh, namely St. John's and Westport. Both developed schemes based upon Christian principles.

> What is this long, costly process to produce as a result? This may be answered in one brief word—ACTION [sic]...a man is educated when he is fitted for the position he is intended by the Providence of God to fill … any education which is not practical in its character is not of real value to you at your present stage of civilisation[32].

The practical feature of Lovedale was its industrial education, a principle first advocated for by David Livingstone through his plea for the three Cs: "Christianity, Commerce, and Civilisation"[33].

Encompassing various shades and tendencies within the wider context of the Scottish Enlightenment philosophy, the Lovedale institution, developed by Stewart, was a place for experimental education based upon Presbyterian measures to reform the "character" of the natives. This scheme was later identified as the "hidden curriculum" by Graham Duncan from Pretoria University. The latter considered the "hidden curriculum" as a means of transformation which is achieved by the destruction of traditional cultures:

> Character formation was the most pervasive subject in the curriculum of mission schools despite the fact that it was nowhere to be found on the timetable. It was a major tool in the Christianising/civilising process with a view to forming compliant Christians and destroying students' commitments to their traditional cultures. Lovedale Missionary Institution is studied as a major locus of the transformation of black students through its WHAM (winning hearts and minds) programme. This transformation affected their spiritual, social, cultural and educational development[34].

Stewart's scheme for renovating the character of the natives remained faithful to Thomas Chalmers' vision of the "Godly Commonwealth" which envisaged the creation of a "new man". That was the vision pursued by the leader of the Free Kirk to reform the Victorian society. He relied on the Biblical concept of the creation of "a New Man" and quoted Peter to justify the need for transformation: "Nevertheless we, according to his promise, look for new heavens and a new earth, wherein dwelleth righteousness"[35]. Home and foreign missionaries strived to "regenerate"

---

[32] James Wells, *Stewart of Lovedale*, *op.cit*, p. 188.

[33] Dominique Borne et Benoit Falaize (Ed.), *Religions et colonisations : XVIᵉ-XXᵉ siècle-Amériques-Asie-Océan*ie, Paris, Editions de l'Atelier, 2009, p. 114.

[34] Graham Duncan, *Winning Hearts and Minds: Character Formation in Mission Education with Special Reference to Lovedale Missionary Institution*, Studia Historiae Ecclesiasticae, Vol. XXXII, No/Nr 1, May/Mei 2006, pp. 1-47.

[35] Thomas Chalmers, *The Works of Thomas Chalmers*, Sermon VII, Philadelphia, Hogan and Co., 1830, pp. 411-417.

people in Britain and abroad via a thorough Christian education that aimed to restore the Old Testament concept of the Covenant between man and God. The African continent was no exception, as stated by Stewart: "If we are to try to make a New Continent, we must have a new man to put into it, otherwise it will be the old story"[36]. So, the Scottish missionary called for "The great work of Africa's regeneration"[37]. As natural virtue, godliness was viewed as innate within each individual, and the African native was required to be spiritually awakened: "[...] Christianity awoke the sleeping spiritual man"[38].

While admitting that there was some form of religiosity in the native, Stewart deplored the absence of religion, a void filled with superstition: "the great bulk of the natives are still without religion, and hold firmly to the old customs and superstitions of their forefathers"[39]. In brief, heathenism, fetishism, witchcraft, heredity and customs were obstacles to missionary progress as they rejected the Gospel: "Most of their superstitions and many of their customs are opposed to the Gospel, and to the morality it teaches"[40].

In the light of Stewart's position, the Scottish evangelical approaches can be seen as variants on the relentless efforts of the Victorians to end "the old story", an old pattern pertaining to Europe, and to start afresh, in Africa, on a sound spiritual basis. If Stewart's views suggested that the spiritual habits of the natives were synonymous with spiritual emptiness, these habits constituted, as might be expected, a sufficiently rich culture to hinder missionary work and challenge evangelical zeal. Henceforth, Scottish education, having been tested at home, became instrumental to the passage from barbarism to civilisation in Africa.

The educational scheme to implement the reformation of the "moral character" of the natives took the official name of "Combined system":

> Lovedale is carried on mainly on three lines—religious, educational, and industrial. Medical work, to some slight extent, was at one time attempted, but given up for want of funds[41].

Traditional, industrial and theological education was provided at the Institute. The term "industrial" was not limited to the traditional 3 R's

---

[36] James Stewart, *Dawn in the Dark Continent*, p. 26.
[37] James Stewart, *Lovedale,* pp. 67-73.
[38] *Ibid.* p. 55.
[39] *Ibid.* p. 94.
[40] *Ibid.* p. 98.
[41] *Ibid.* p. 8.

taught in Scottish parochial schools; it included carpentry, wagon-making, blacksmithing, printing, bookbinding, and telegraphing. There was also a girls' school where the three R's, Catechism and housekeeping were taught. The diversity of the curriculum enabled every student who was able to pay fees to be educated according to his/her gift and to become a member of the "Godly Commonwealth" and the colonial society at large. Lovedale, which was built upon the model of the parochial system defended by Thomas Chalmers, constituted a typical case of universal education[42]. The wide range of subjects, which was complemented by workshops, provided pupils with both theoretical and practical education.

The expansion of Lovedale was mainly achieved thanks to extensive funding. Admittedly, neither students nor the Free Kirk could afford to fund the whole system. As the saying goes, funding had become "the sinew of war" and "necessity knew no law". Therefore, Stewart had to make a conscious choice for industrial education, thereby aligning himself with the colonial policy. The cooperation with both the industrialists and the colonial Government corresponded to their pursuit of assimilating the natives into the economy of the Empire. Consequently, implementing the Presbyterian ideal meant cooperating with the industrialists and the Colonial Government. According to *The Times*, Cecil Rhodes, who was a businessman, a statesman and a great subscriber to imperialism, strongly advocated for education for all, and Lovedale was very fortunate to attract his attention: "He was one of the warmest and most convinced supporters of Lovedale"[43].

Sir George Grey, the Governor of the Cape colony, also promoted an industrial-based education and Lovedale was favoured by circumstances and benefitted from his material support. As a former Governor of New Zealand, Sir Grey was willing to apply industrial education, which was previously tested on the Maori tribes, who are part of the natives of the Cape, in South Africa. Although Sir Grey had already tried industrial education in New Zealand, the concept of industrial schooling had taken its roots in industrialising Britain. For instance, Thomas Chalmers had created Mechanics Institutes, which are educational establishments, to train the adult working class in Scotland.

From 1855 to 1863, sums of money invested in African education, under Grey, amounted to £55,046, and Lovedale was among the beneficiaries:

---

[42] In Scotland, Thomas Chalmers had drawn up the "penny-a-week system", a highly controversial financial method, enabling the poor to be educated in return for a penny per week.

[43] *The Times*, 20th March 1902, in James Stewart, *Dawn in the Dark Continent, op. cit.* pp. 198-199.

The major recipients of the funds were Lovedale and the four Wesleyan institutions of Healdtown, Salem, Lesseyton, and Durban, founded in response to Grey's offer of aid[44].

As a compliment to the colonial government's grants, Stewart dedicated his book, *Lovedale, South Africa: illustrated from fifty views from photographs*, to Sir George Grey and wrote as follows:

The main features of Sir George Grey's wise and humane native policy were these: to combat superstition by promoting Christianity; to shake native faith in witchcraft, and those who practised it by skilled medical aid; to overcome ignorance by native schools; and to counteract indolence by industrial training in various trades, and by employment on works of public utility[45].

The book was published in 1894 and there was no longer much funding from the colonial government. However, by paying tribute to Grey, Stewart can be understood to revive the central role of the Cape policies in the development of education in the Cape colony. He also showed photographs of natives who had made considerable progress in education and industrial achievements. This was also a strategy to call for support from across Scotland. In fact, Stewart clearly expresses this intention in the opening chapter of his book. It is a showcase of the amount of progress made by the natives according to the Scottish norms and also the interaction between mission and imperialism[46].

Admittedly, the partnership could lead to confusion as the mission and the colonial Government could be perceived as one and the same.

Although Stewart complained about the financial hardship, he was motivated to spread his educational system beyond Lovedale: "The combined method is the right method, not only for a small locality, or for a single mission, but for the whole African continent"[47].

His education policy seemed to meet the mission and the government's needs, but side-lined the natives who remained under a new form of slavery. The early missionaries had contested the slave trade in order to

---

[44] R. Hunt and JR Davis, *1855-1863: A Dividing Point in the Early Development of African Education in South Africa*, Collected Seminar Papers, London, Institute of Commonwealth Studies, 18, 1975, pp. 4-5.

[45] James Stewart, *Lovedale, op. cit.*, p. 3.

[46] T. Jack Thomson, *Capturing the Image: African Missionary Photography as Enslavement and Liberation,* Day Associates Lecture, June 29, 2007, Yale University Divinity School, New Haven, CT.

[47] James Stewart, *Lovedale, op. cit.,* p. 33.

legitimise their undertaking in Africa. The industrial education in Lovedale could also be viewed as a new way of dominating by training skilled slaves to serve the expansion and wealth of the Empire.

At all events, the role of the industrial mission station in colonial society could be ambiguous. The explorer and colonial administrator, Sir Henry Johnston, testified on the ambiguity inherent in representing the mission as an independent entity, but also as a beacon of the Empire:

> The immediate object is not profit, they can afford to reside at places till they become profitable. They strengthen our hold over the country, they spread the use of the English language, they induct the natives into the best kind of civilization and in fact each mission is an essay in colonisation[48].

However, it would be unfair to confine Lovedale to such a limited role. For, beyond colonial expansion and the exploitation of natural wealth, Stewart promoted universal education: "While we are entirely Presbyterian, we are also entirely and openly non-denominational. We are both colour blind and denominationally blind"[49]. Stewart's paternalistic scheme to educate the natives with the support of the colonial office could be understood to epitomize utilitarianism. Despite Stewart's relentless zeal to develop his mission, he clearly set limits. Missionaries were training agents; the rest of the grand design was in the hands of the natives:

> How is Africa to be evangelised? ...Africa can never be evangelised by white men, nor can the rough work of laying the foundation of a new civilisation be done by them. Climate, language, number of men required, and the inevitable expenditure of vast sums of money...White men can just direct and train the agents[50].

Accordingly, once trained, the natives were ready to manage a self-supporting church. When Stewart was appointed to Lovedale, in 1866, the committee in charge then drew up a mandate for the management of Lovedale henceforth:

> As soon as native congregations are formed, their care ought to, as speedily as possible, be consigned to a native pastorate... in time to be supported by natives themselves, while the Europeans should be free to press on to the

---

[48] *Johnston to British South Africa Company,* 17 July 1870, Roland Oliver, *Sir Henry Johnston and the Scramble for Africa*, London, Chatto & Windus, 1957, p. 182.

[49] James Wells, *Stewart of Lovedale*, op. cit., p. 101.

[50] James Stewart, *Lovedale, op. cit.,* p. 36.

regions beyond[51].

If Stewart envisaged a possible native church, passing the baton would be in a distant future. In 1897, the foundation of the Presbyterian Church of South Africa, composed of a majority of whites, was indeed the child of the mother Church in Scotland and its missions in South Africa. It was the Free Church which was to put the wheels in motion. At the end of the 19th century, the order of priority was redefined by the mission committee in Scotland. It resulted in a split between the missionaries and the mother Church. Nonetheless, Stewart kept on advocating for evangelisation as the prime mission of the church. On the contrary, the committee, possibly motivated by financial considerations, inverted the initial order. From then on, amongst the three "self's: "self-supporting, self-governing, self-propagating of African Churches", financial autonomy became the first assignment[52].

Indeed, the home Church's mission policy and Stewart's education policy were to contribute to an interesting religious phenomenon called *Ethiopianism*. Mzimba Pambani Jeremiah (1850-1911) was an ex-Lovedale graduate who founded the Presbyterian Church of Africa. While Lovedale had all the characteristics of an institution based on slavery, it also provoked the circumstances for the spiritual emancipation of the natives. Lovedale trained new black elite for the ministry and Mzimba was an illustrative case. Lovedale was both the setting and the originating force for the first schism of the Free Church in the colonies. Legally independent, the new confession had all the characteristics of Presbyterianism and also retained some form of tribal system. Therefore, the native confession, a symbol of the Presbyterian model, represented, on the one hand, the bond between the Presbyterian tradition and the African social structure and, on the other, the spiritual and racial split between natives and colonialists.

Although Stewart had envisaged the ecclesiastical autonomy of the natives, the formation of such an early movement caught him unprepared. Consequently, he viewed the new church as a disappointment and an act of treason:

> The name Ethiopian Church was admirably conceived as an appeal both to race and religion, though probably race, more than religion, had to do with

---

[51] James Wells, *Stewart of Lovedale*, p. 289.
[52] Graham Duncan, "*The Role of Mission Councils in the Scottish Missions in South Africa*, 1864-1923" in *Studia Historiae Ecclesiasticae*: *Journal of the Church History Society of Southern Africa*, vol. 38, no. 1, pp. 217-234.

the whole movement. There was a good deal said at first about the Ethiopians going to evangelise the heathen[53].

Like his Victorian contemporaries, Stewart dreaded the sectarian downward spiral which could threaten the colonial order. Under the indirect rule, the colonial administration embraced the mission and gave it financial support and, in turn, the mission played the role of a pathfinder for the nation. The mission, therefore, had to meet the economic requirements of the colonial power by training a native elite and a working class. According to plan, these would start expressing themselves spiritually and move on to found their own religious institution.

Inasmuch as mission education did not open the way for power in colonial society, religion became a vehicle for emancipation. However, the missionaries were not ready for any significant spiritual awakening of the natives, at least for the time being.

From Mission to Missiology: Stewart's Inductive Theology and Thought over Mission Education

Missiology covers a wide range of topics related to mission work (structures, self-governance, partnership, mission/church relations and cultural reform) which, in the present analysis of mission education, relates to several issues:

> Colonialism, paternalism, denominationalism, voluntarism and para-church[54]. Stewart insisted that missionary work should be recognised as […] a science of missions—a science which does not yet exist[55].

Observing the missionary field for 40 years or so, Stewart had been able to elaborate a practical missiology based upon his educational experiments in Lovedale. Stewart wrote three books on Lovedale, which helped to develop the representation of mission work as a science: first, *Lovedale, Past and Present*; second, Lovedale*, South Africa: Illustrated by Fifty Views from Photographs*, which was published in Scotland in 1894 and was designed largely for a British audience of mission supporters; and lastly, *Dawn in the Dark Continent; or Africa and its Missions* which was

---

[53] James Stewart, *Dawn in the Dark Continent,* p. 185.
[54] Clayton E. Quaterman, *The Application of Presbyterian Polity and Transfer of Leadership in Cross-cultural Situations: A Study in Presbyterian Missiology*, University of Wales, 5 June 2005, PhD. Thesis, p. 100.
[55] James Stewart, *Dawn in the Dark Continent,* p. 288.

published in 1903 and was recognised as the standard work for missionary technique.

By and large, Stewart's approach to practical missiology consisted of a critical analysis of the mission-field in general. The role performed by missiology was first to assess the work of the missionaries and to measure the progress made by the mission. Through a thorough review of the success and failure of the overall venture, missiology helped to tackle the problems and provide adequate solutions to reform the present system, both at home and overseas. The management of Lovedale, its agents and students, were put under severe scrutiny and very clear highlights of discrepancies were revealed to be strong challenges facing the overall mission undertaking.

The science of missiology was intended to help contextualise missionary tasks and bridge the gap between a British culture and the African tribal systems. To Stewart, missiology was envisaged as a means to match the spiritual needs of the otherness with Christianity. It came as no surprise that Stewart perceived propagating the Gospel as a huge and a painful task, more often leading to failure. On occasion, Stewart complained about the hard work, finding it "depressing and occasionally disappointing"[56]. And he would add: "Should any one [who may read this] choose the African continent as a field of work, he needs not fear that his life's work will be labour lost"[57].

Moreover, criticism from Britain was abundant concerning the question of whether or not missionary work was beneficial across the Empire. Missions needed to be examined and organised to meet the home Church's needs. It was also important to reform the management of missions by redefining the relationship between the mission and the Church.

While Stewart focused on the local obstacles and turmoil, he also pointed out the difficulties brought about by the Church in Scotland: "weaknesses exist at both ends of the line"[58]. He observed that quasi autonomy given to the missions over the years had led the "line" to be gradually loose. The distance and the diverging visions frequently caused the mission to drift away from the mother Church and its ethos. The logical result was that they would end up failing to comprehend each other's purpose. Quoting Reverend Principal Lang, Stewart denounced the "cumbrous machinery of consultative boards and big committees"[59].

---

[56] James Stewart, *Lovedale,* p. 102.

[57] *Ibid.* p. 67.

[58] James Stewart, *Dawn in the Dark Continent, op. cit.*, p. 325.

[59] *Ibid.* p. 325.

Parting from a critical approach, based upon an extensive examination of the past and present situation, Stewart developed a practical theology of mission which drew from his experiments in Africa. He took into account the multiple contexts and identified major lines such as

> the training of missionary-public, the organization of the native force, the future of the native Church, home administration or organization and the uniformity of statistics to present the missionary situation[60].

Stewart made an attempt to systemise the missionary work by dividing it.

As Stewart became aware of the tremendous mission toil that the pagan African continent presented, he argued for the training of an effective agency. Although he recognised the quality of ministry education in Scotland, he underlined the need for a missionary trained in specific skills:

> […] the purely theological training he receives in common with the minister whose life is to be spent in a city or country parish is good as far as it goes, but for him as a missionary it is wholly defective, because incomplete[61].

He stated further that an intuition could not replace training and experience in the process of converting the heathens. Accordingly, Stewart set up a curriculum based upon three lines:

> How to deal with a false religion; How to deal with a dead conscience; How to deal best with a strange people, to whom we white men are rather unaccountable beings, and whose real opinion about us, individually and nationally, it is so difficult to reach, because so carefully concealed[62].

Stewart's statements revealed a change in the way the native was perceived all along. This was evidenced by the mounting of a curriculum that, henceforth, focused on Comparative Religion or the Faiths of the Heathen World and the History, Customs and Condition of the People. No doubt, propagating the Gospel was the primary mission and the aim to transfer a Presbyterian norm remained unchanged. However, the methods employed to meet the objectives were revised to be in line with established experiments. From then on, Stewart's perception of the native character shifted from a pre-conceived vision fuelled by Victorian thoughts to a

---

[60] *Ibid.* p. 18.
[61] *Ibid.* p. 330.
[62] *Ibid.* p. 332.

resolute attempt to understand the native and his environment. For instance, he realised that some natives could be indolent, not because they were naturally indolent, but because their character had been moulded by their environment:

> The African's indolence cannot be excused, but may be partly explained. He has never been trained to work by that successful teacher, Necessity. He has not cultivated more than he required for his own use, because there have been no markets. One ton of grain in Central Africa was as useful to him as if he grew a hundred tons, since the latter would simply rot on the ground. Constant wars and raids took away all sense of security or permanence of tenure[63].

While the cultural and social structures of natives were profoundly transformed by the curriculum in Lovedale, the African context also contributed to modifying the missionaries approach to the indigenous society. Although a vast majority of missionaries continue to share the view that natives suffer from intellectual inferiority, Stewart stood out as an exception, arguing for the contrary:

> […] referrals to the perceived intellectual inferiority of black people were refuted by two principals of Lovedale Missionary Institution, Drs James Stewart and Robert HW Shepherd, who noted not only the excellent achievement of both black and white students in examinations, but also the former's academic superiority in cases[64].

To some extent, the task to redefine a long-instilled Victorian perception of the native was rather an ambitious adventure. Nonetheless, Stewart believed that a sound theological training offered to all the members of the British society could overcome the *clichés* upheld throughout the Empire.

Stewart made an appeal to the Christian laity, men and women, to reinforce the existing missionary workforce composed of ministers, ruling elders and deacons. Inspired by the Free Church home mission, he emphasised that:

> the necessity for the existence of this new arm of the missionary service, namely, a volunteer, or unpaid, or honorary contingent, whose work shall

---

[63] *Ibid.* p. 363.
[64] Andrew Lewis and Johann C. Steyn, "*A critique of mission education in South Africa according to Bosch's mission paradigm theory*" in *South African Journal of Education*, 2003 EASA, Vol 23(2), pp. 101-106.