

Saint John
Henry Newman

Saint John Henry Newman:

Preserving and Promulgating His Legacy

Edited by

Robert C. Christie

Cambridge
Scholars
Publishing



Saint John Henry Newman: Preserving and Promulgating His Legacy

Edited by Robert C. Christie

This book first published 2019

Cambridge Scholars Publishing

Lady Stephenson Library, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE6 2PA, UK

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Copyright © 2019 by Robert C. Christie and contributors

All rights for this book reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the copyright owner.

ISBN (10): 1-5275-3631-9

ISBN (13): 978-1-5275-3631-9

Dedication

*This volume is dedicated to the memory of Father Vincent Giese,
founder of the Venerable John Henry Newman Association,
now known as the Saint John Henry Newman Association
and the sponsor of this volume,
and to the hundreds of men and women, lay and clerical,
who have worked and contributed to the success of the mission
of the Association to promulgate the life and work
John Henry Newman for more than four decades.*

Acknowledgements

*The editor is grateful to
Father John T. Ford, C.S.C. and Edward Jeremy Miller, emeritus
members of the Board of Directors of the Newman Association,
Father Ian Ker, and Edward Short,
who read parts of the manuscript and made very helpful suggestions,
and to Mary Jo Dorsey,
Communications Coordinator for the Newman Association, for her
assistance in providing many of the images throughout the text.*

Front cover painting reproduced by permission of the artist, Paul Newton, who provided the commentary below:

I came to paint Newman as part of a larger commission for the Catholic Church in Australia at the time they were about to open a pilgrim centre in Rome: Domus Australia. The portrait subjects for the Domus Australia chapel, including Newman, were given to me by the Archbishop. There were 32 pictures to paint and I was given the names of the subjects of the works, and the dimensions of the canvases, but no instructions as to how I should depict those subjects - that was left up to me. I believe the rationale was that they wanted two English saints (More and Newman) along with two Irish saints (Brigid and Patrick) to illustrate the connection to Australia of these two countries from which the ancestors of so many Australians originally came.

While researching Newman for the portrait I tried to get a feel for the man himself in the way I would if I were painting the portrait of a living person. While painting the portrait I remember listening (online) to Elgar's *The Dream of Gerontius*, the text of which I believe Newman wrote at his standing desk!

When it came to painting Newman I considered a range of options. As the canvas was to be tall and narrow, to fit into the existing paneling in the chapel, I decided to depict him in a full length standing pose. I was fascinated by Newman's use of a standing desk, a thing which is so in-vogue currently; so I decided to include the desk and create a visual link by having him rest his elbow upon it. From photos of his private study I created a background that I hoped would look authentic. I painted him in his choir robes rather than the black and scarlet Roman vestments so he would stand out against the dark background. I placed his right foot across his left to add a casual quirky quality which I thought would be appropriate and add visual interest to the pose.

For a person who makes a living painting portraits as I do, the main limiting factor was that I didn't have him to pose for me from life! As such I was reliant on existing photographic reference for his head/face. Providentially I was able to use one particular old sepia photo, with a few adjustments (such as a change to his right hand) as the basis for the portrait. I then posed a friend of mine in choir robes that I borrowed from St Mary's Cathedral, to complete the picture.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	ix
Biographical Sketches of Contributing Authors.....	x
Introduction	1
John Henry Newman: The Man and His Legacy <i>Robert C. Christie</i>	
Chapter One.....	10
Eleven Major Elements of Newman’s Legacy Critical for Our Time: <i>Robert C. Christie</i>	
Section One: Overarching Perspectives	
Chapter Two	34
Personalism and Process: John Henry Newman’s Dialogue with ‘Nones’ <i>John T. Ford, C.S.C.</i>	
Chapter Three	49
John Henry Newman’s Influence on Bernard Lonergan <i>Richard L. Liddy</i>	
Section Two: Faith and Conversion	
Chapter Four	74
The Reasoning that Justifies Faith: Newman’s Last Observations and Walgrave’s Elaboration <i>Edward Jeremy Miller</i>	
Chapter Five	95
Tradition and Heresy – <i>The Arians of the Fourth Century</i> and Newman’s Conversion <i>Sr. Kathleen Dietz, FSO</i>	

Section Three: Church, Home, and Newman's Personalism

Chapter Six	110
Newman's View of the Church as a Home: Ecclesiology & Theological Anthropology in a Pastoral Context	
<i>Donald Graham</i>	

Chapter Seven	129
"Echoes from Home": The Personalist Ground of Newman's Ecclesiology: Affection as the Key to Newman's Intellectual Conversion to the True Church	
<i>Robert C. Christie</i>	

Section Four: Education and Pedagogy

Chapter Eight.....	166
Recovering the Lost Tradition of Catholic Higher Education: The Enduring Relevance of Newman's Insights for the Contemporary University	
<i>Mark A. Jubulis</i>	

Chapter Nine.....	188
Portrait of an Apprentice: Newman's Vision for Personal Education in the Modern Academy a Tribute to Fr. John Ford, C.S.C.	
<i>David Delio</i>	

Section Five: History, Hagiography, and Method

Chapter Ten	206
Hagiography, History, and John Henry Newman	
<i>Edward T. Short</i>	

Chapter Eleven	235
John Henry Newman and His Distorters	
<i>Ian T. Ker</i>	

Addendum

Chapter Twelve	260
A Brief Newman Biography: A Dramatic Life	
<i>Robert C. Christie</i>	

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The editor is grateful to Father John T. Ford, C.S.C. and Edward Jeremy Miller, emeritus members of the Board of Directors of the Newman Association, Father Ian Ker, and Edward Short, who read parts of the manuscript and made very helpful suggestions, and to Mary Jo Dorsey, Communications Coordinator for the Newman Association, for her assistance in providing many of the images throughout the text.

BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCHES OF CONTRIBUTING AUTHORS (IN ALPHABETICAL ORDER)

Robert. C. Christie is the president of the Newman Association of America and has served on its Board of Directors for twenty years. He is also editor of the Association's newsletter. His doctoral dissertation was a study of the conversions of John Henry Newman, under the direction of Newman scholar Avery Cardinal Dulles. He was formerly Senior Professor of Philosophy and Religion at DeVry University in North Brunswick, NJ and is the former Executive Director of the National Institute for Newman Studies. He has authored numerous articles and book chapters on Newman.

David Peter Delio is the S. E. Canizaro Associate Professor of Theology and Chair of the Theology Department at the University of Holy Cross (UHC), New Orleans. Prior to joining UHC, Delio, a New England native, matriculated to Trinity University in San Antonio, TX and earned a BA in Composite Social Studies and a Master of Arts in Teaching. He worked as a middle school teacher in both California and Texas before returning to Massachusetts to study at the Weston Jesuit School of Theology in Cambridge. Following his M.T.S and an Advanced Certificate in Theology, Delio began his doctoral studies at the Catholic University of America (CUA) in Washington, DC. He completed his doctoral work on John Henry Newman under the direction of Rev. John T. Ford, CSC and taught as a Theology Lecturer at Georgetown University and Teaching Fellow at CUA. In 2016, Dr. Delio published *An aristocracy of exalted spirits: The Idea of the Church in Newman's Tamworth Reading Room*, by Gracewing Publishers. He is the founder of the new initiative, The Newman Idea, headquartered at the University of Holy Cross, and he is a member of the Board of Directors of the Newman Association of America.

Sister Kathleen Dietz, FSO, is a member of The Spiritual Family The Work, the custodians of The College in Littlemore, where Newman converted. She obtained her doctorate in theology with a dissertation on Newman's ecclesiology and has published a number of articles and co-

authored a book on Newman. She enjoys giving talks on various aspects of Newman's life and writings. She currently resides with her community in Erie, Pennsylvania, where she serves as Vice-Chancellor of the Diocese of Erie.

John T. Ford, CSC, is Professor Emeritus of Theology and Religious Studies and former coordinator of Hispanic/Latino studies at Catholic University of America in Washington, D.C. A graduate of the University of Notre Dame, he received his master's degree in theology from Holy Cross College in Washington and his licentiate and doctorate in theology from the Gregorian University in Rome. His areas of teaching included 19th-century theology, contemporary ecumenism, and Hispanic theology. Fr. Ford has served as president of the North American Academy of Ecumenists, as a member of the United Methodist Roman Catholic Dialogue, an observer-consultant for the Consultation on Church Union, a member of the Ecumenism Committee of the Washington Theological Consortium and also a member of the Faith and Order Commission of the National Council of Churches. Among his publications, he is coeditor with Dr. Darlis Swan of *Twelve Tales Untold: A Study Guide for Ecumenical Reception*. Fr. Ford is a founding member and past chair of the Newman Association of America, and is an emeritus member of its Board of Directors. He is the author of *John Henry Newman: Spiritual Writings Selected with an Introduction* (Orbis Books, 2012), in addition to many other articles on Newman and an array of spiritual and theological subjects. In 2016 Fr. Ford was awarded the Gailliot Newman Scholar of the Year Award.

Donald Graham has studied in Canada, the United States, and England. He holds undergraduate degrees in history and education, masters' degrees in Ministry and Theology, a License in Sacred Theology and a Doctorate in Catholic Studies. He is Assistant Professor of Systematic and Pastoral Theology at St. Augustine's Seminary within the Toronto School of Theology affiliated with the University of Toronto, Supervisor of graduate students at Maryvale Institute and Liverpool-Hope University in the UK, Adjunct Professor of Catholic Studies at Sacred Heart College in Peterborough Ontario, a member of the Editorial Board of *Newman Studies Journal* and a columnist for his diocesan paper, *The Herald*. Representative publications include *From Eastertide to Ecclesia. John Henry Newman, the Holy Spirit and the Church* (Marquette, 2011), the chapter, "Sympathy in the Spiritual Theology of John Henry Newman," in *Newman & Life in the Spirit: Theological Reflections on Spirituality*

Today (Fortress, 2014) and articles in *Communio*, *Louvain Studies*, *The Downside Review* and *Newman Studies Journal*. Dr. Graham's research interests focus upon the intersection of Trinitarian theology, Christology, pneumatology, ecclesiology and the spiritual theology of Blessed John Henry Newman.

Mark A. Jubulis is an associate professor of political science at Gannon University in Erie, PA. He received his Ph.D in Government and International Relations from the University of Notre Dame. He has published mainly on the subject of nationalism, especially in post-communist states, while he has also presented several papers at the annual conference of the Newman Association of America. He has served on the Mission and Identity Council at Gannon and on the Bishop's Pastoral Planning Committee for the Diocese of Erie.

Ian Ker is an English Roman Catholic priest, scholar and author, universally regarded as the leading authority on John Henry Newman, on whom he has published more than twenty books. 'Father Ker is a senior research fellow at Blackfriars, Oxford. He has taught both English literature and theology at universities in the UK and USA. Father Ker is author of the generally acknowledged *definitive* biography of Newman, *John Henry Newman: A Biography* (Oxford University Press, 1988). His other books include *The Catholic Revival in English Literature 1845-1961*, *G. K. Chesterton: A Biography*, and *Newman on Vatican II*. He was also co-editor of *The Cambridge Companion to Newman* (2009), contributing the chapter 'The Church as Communion'. His renowned biography of Newman will be reissued with added material in time for Newman's canonization this year.

Monsignor **Richard Liddy** is a Catholic priest, professor and director of the Center for Catholic Studies at Seton Hall University. He studied under Bernard J. Lonergan, S. J., one of the foremost interpreters of the thought of John Henry Newman in the 20th century. He is also the director of the Bernard J. Lonergan Institute and editor of *The Lonergan Review*, which promote Lonergan's philosophical teachings. He has authored the books *Startling Strangeness: Reading Lonergan's Insight*, *Transforming Light: Intellectual Conversion in the Early Lonergan*, and *In God's Gentle Arms*. He is also past president of the Newman Association of America and a member of its Board of Directors from 2014-2019.

Edward Jeremy Miller is emeritus Professor of Religious Studies at Gwynedd Mercy University, Gwynedd Valley, Pennsylvania. He earned a Ph.D. and subsequently an S.T.D. summa cum laude from the University of Louvain (KU Leuven), Belgium, mentored by the renowned Newman scholar, Jan Hendrick Walgrave. Before coming to Gwynedd Mercy, he was professor of Roman Catholic theology and chair of the Ph.D. program in constructive theology at Emory University, the dean of a graduate school, and an officer for core curriculum grants at the National Endowment for the Humanities. At Gwynedd he as also taught throughout its Honors Program curriculum and has chaired the university's Division of Humanities. His works on Newman include editor of *Conscience the Path to Holiness: Walking with Newman*, (Cambridge Scholars Press, 2014), *Newman: Doctor of the Church* (Oxford, 2007), *Discourse and Context: An Interdisciplinary Study of John Henry Newman* (Carbondale, 1993), *Critical Essays on John Henry Newman* (Victoria BC, 1992), and *John Henry Newman on the Idea of Church* (Shepherdstown, 1987). He has also published articles in leading theological journals in this country and in Europe. Currently he is emeritus board member of The Newman Association of America, past vice-president of The College Theology Society, a past chairperson of the Southeast Region and of the Mid-Atlantic Eastern Region of CTS, the coordinator of the Newman Continuing Seminar of The Catholic Theological Society of America, and a member of the International Society of Cardinal Newman Scholars. He can be contacted at miller.e@gmercyu.edu.

Edward Short is the author of two studies of Blessed John Henry Cardinal Newman, *Newman and his Contemporaries* (2011) and *Newman and his Family* (2013), as well as *Culture and Abortion* (2012), and *Adventures in the Book Pages: Essays and Reviews* (2105). He lives in New York with his wife and two young children.

INTRODUCTION

JOHN HENRY NEWMAN: THE MAN AND HIS LEGACY

ROBERT C. CHRISTIE

John Henry Newman, a 19th century English intellectual, cleric, and convert from Anglicanism to Roman Catholicism, is often in the news these days particularly in Catholic circles, having had two miracles attributed to his intercession within the last ten years. The first was confirmed by the Vatican in 2010 when Deacon Jack Sullivan of Boston was miraculously alleviated of an incurable paralytic back condition after praying to Newman, which led Pope Benedict XVI to declare Newman “Blessed” that same year. Then in November, 2018, the Vatican approved a second miracle, that of a young American woman who had received a life-threatening diagnosis during pregnancy. She prayed for Newman’s intercession, and she was subsequently healed beyond medical explanation. The two miracles fulfill the requirement of the Roman Catholic Church for sainthood, and Newman’s canonization occurred on October 13, 2019. But yet to many Newman is not very well known, if at all. So who was this Victorian man of letters, and why does his life and work continue to attract devotees today? What was there about him that the Roman Catholic Church may bestow upon him its highest honor – the declaration of sainthood? Moreover, what accounts for his enduring appeal more than a century after his death? The noted Newman scholar Louis Bouyer suggests an answer to these questions: “He managed to write a number of volumes touching on all the aspects of Catholic theology and spirituality with constant reference to the cultural situations of the day, and an often prophetic insight into what was to be the evolution of human society at large in the coming century.”¹ So Newman has endowed us with a legacy—a valuable treasure bequeathed to us from the past, a

¹ Louis Bouyer, Foreword, *Parochial and Plain Sermons* (San Francisco: Ignatius, 1997), xii.

tangible set of writings and an intangible memory handed down to us, the long-lasting effect of his life and work.² With Newman's canonization, the time is ripe for a reexamination of his life and work with particular focus on what they have to say to us today, as we contend with a church in crisis and a culture more and more bereft of its spiritual and moral moorings.

The preservation and promulgation of Newman's legacy are the twin missions of the Newman Association of America, the sponsor of this volume. Newman casts a wide net, and all who are taken up into it are all the better for it, both intellectually and spiritually. On the whole, this volume seeks to establish that Newman's life and work have immense relevance and value for us today. The intended audience of this collection of essays is broad, from Newman scholars to the general reader who may have heard recently of Newman and who wishes to learn more about him. In the world of Newman studies, this volume is situated between the lengthy in-depth scholarly Newman biographies and monographs and the more focused and detailed treatments of selected areas of Newman's life and work. Accordingly, it should be useful for an academic course curriculum, while readers outside academia will find both its style and content amenable to the discovery and enrichment of their knowledge of one of the greatest minds of the last two hundred years. For Newman studies, the volume offers a rich presentation of the elements that establish the content and importance of Newman's legacy.

In seeking to establish that legacy, I employed two criteria through which I identified eleven major elements that I suggest are of especial value today and which speak to a wide spectrum of readers, from the spiritual searcher to the philosophical questioner to the theological believer, be they lay men and women, clergy, or religious. Whatever one's station in life, the scope of Newman's legacy has something valuable to offer. I now turn to those two criteria followed by a description of the eleven primary elements of Newman's legacy, as I see it, concluding with a description of each of the essays.

The two criteria that provide the foundation of Newman's legacy are first, drawn from the massive output of the public Newman, those writings which comprise the Newman canon – some forty volumes as well as numerous other formal writings published during his lifetime. The second criterion is drawn from the private and personal Newman, contained in his journals as well as his private correspondence. He left behind a collection

² Oxford English Dictionary, Third edition (Oxford: Oxford University Press, March, 2016).

of more than 20,000 letters which give us insight into the personal Newman. Here we learn about the man, his thoughts and emotions, and especially his relationships. I derived from these sources eleven specific elements that comprise Newman's legacy, as I see it, and when taken *in toto*, these are extremely valuable for theology and spirituality today, forming the structure of his formidable legacy. He was the intellectual in pursuit of truth, the spiritual sojourner seeking personal holiness, the believer as well as one challenged by the nature of belief, the philosophical questioner, the educator of hierarchy, laity, pastors, evangelists, and social critics.

I suggest that these eleven primary elements characterize Newman's life and work, forming his legacy that speaks forcefully to our age. To set the stage for the essays in this collection, I will expand upon them in Chapter One. Among the major elements of Newman's legacy is his literary work, and the writer James Joyce considered him to be "the greatest of English prose writers."³ The literary critic Harold Bloom posed the question, "What is it, then, that I, and many others, appreciate in genius?"⁴ He quoted from Ralph Waldo Emerson in answer:

Were you ever instructed by a wise and eloquent man? Remember then, were not the words that made your blood run cold, that brought the blood to your cheeks, that made you tremble or delighted you, - did they not sound to you as old as yourself? Was it not truth that you knew before, or do you ever expect to be moved from the pulpit or from man by anything but plain truth? Never. It is God in you that responds to God without, or affirms his own words trembling on the lips of another.⁵

In another essay, "Genius: A Personal Definition," Bloom extolled:

The ancient answer is that there is a god within us, and the god speaks. I think that a materialist definition of genius is impossible, which is why the idea of genius is so discredited in an age like our own, where materialist ideologies dominate. Genius, by necessity, invokes the transcendental and the extraordinary, because it is fully conscious of them.

Consciousness is what defines genius . . . (which) exceeds us in consciousness, goes beyond the highest order of consciousness that we are capable of knowing without them.

³ *Portraits of the Artist in Exile Recollections of James Joyce by Europeans*, Willard Potts, ed. (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1979).

⁴ Harold Bloom, "What is Genius?," Introduction to *Genius: A Mosaic of One Hundred Exemplary Minds*, (New York: Warner Books, 2002).

⁵ Ibid.

Bloom further reasoned:

The question we need to put to any writer must be: does he or she augment our consciousness, and how is it done? I find this a rough but effectual test: . . . has my awareness been intensified, my consciousness widened and clarified? . . . What is best and oldest in myself has . . . been activated.⁶

Writing from his literary perspective, but with a universal scope, Bloom identified these personal traits of genius that we find resonating throughout Newman's life and work. We have firm ground, then, to call Newman a genius, and this volume represents that genius. It is Newman who so moves, alters, and inflames our consciousness through a mosaic of his eleven elements which, when taken as a whole, give us a legacy of extraordinary value whereby we can traverse the bridge from the immanent to the transcendent in a manner and to a degree which we rarely experience in other thinkers. A genius possessed of such elements, as explicated by the essays that follow, sustains the argument that Newman's legacy warrants our attention, admiration, and study for intellectual, spiritual, and communal benefit today. A brief description of each chapter follows.

In Chapter One I review in detail my suggested eleven major elements of Newman's legacy and how and where we encounter them in his life and work. This extended discussion and analysis serve to deepen our understanding of the great value of Newman's legacy for us today. Newman broadens our intellect, promotes our spirituality, and develops our understanding of the Church. His great gifts to us through his legacy are rare tools to be employed in our own search for truth and the love of, and for, God.

Chapters two and three address overarching perspectives of Newman's life. In his essay "Personalism and Process: John Henry Newman's Dialogue with 'Nones'," John Ford addresses the perennial problem of unbelief, which is rampant in our age. While religion imbued everyday life in Newman's day, the opposite is true today, especially amongst the "nones" – those who hold no religious affiliation. Ford traces how Newman employed the dual methods of "two apparently irreconcilable opposites in engaging others, personalism and process," that can be useful aids in promoting dialogue today. "Twenty-first century evangelists," Ford writes, "might then do well to imitate Newman's approach of both understanding the intellectual difficulties of 'nones' and assisting them pastorally in responding to questions about faith." Ford describes

⁶ Ibid.

Newman's process: "question, inference, assent—which provide(s) a common basis for dialogue with non-believers."

In Chapter Three, Richard Liddy provides us with his life-long study that traces Newman's influence on the Canadian Jesuit philosopher-theologian, Bernard Lonergan (1904-1984), who applied Newman's critical philosophical analytic method and insights to contemporary epistemology and theological method. "My fundamental mentor and guide has been John Henry Newman's *Grammar of Assent*," wrote Lonergan.⁷ In his conclusion that contrasts Newman and Lonergan, Liddy states: "Lonergan transforms Newman's quasi-technical expression in the light of the advances of human knowledge in the late 19th and 20th centuries (and) transforms Newman's common sense expressions into technical expression on the level of these late modern times – some would say, postmodern times." Newman's work in epistemology had a major influence on Lonergan, and philosophers of knowledge and those who wish to better understand these issues can benefit greatly from a study of Newman's influence on Lonergan as presented in Liddy's article.

The subjects of chapters four and five are faith and conversion. In the former, Edward Jeremy Miller addresses the perennial issue encountered in every age in his essay "The Reasoning that Justifies Faith: Newman's Last Observations and Walgrave's Elaboration." Newman balanced his strong concern, in his sermons and poetry, for the "devout life" with equal regard for the reasonableness of Christian belief, this in an age of growing agnosticism. This is why Newman called himself a controversialist. He entered into argumentation with a foe, whether a person or the *zeitgeist*. Newman was somewhat unique in the nineteenth century in the way he made the case for justifying faith by reasoning in an age under the influence of the Enlightenment's intellectual, logical rationalist bent. But Newman's *métier* was personalist. For him, the whole person was reflected in the imagination, memory, and one's conscience, along with the work of the intellect - one's *moral sense*. Prof. John Henry Walgrave of Louvain (Leuven), through a lifetime of studying both Newman and twentieth-century philosophy, absorbed Newman's personalist approach and perceived supports for it in many contemporary philosophers. Newman initiated and Walgrave later championed a personalist epistemology in making the case for Christian belief's being a reasonable choice, if not a strongly divinely-invited choice. In this matter Walgrave was preserving Newman's legacy and was recognized as one of Newman's

⁷ Bernard Lonergan, "Reality, Myth, Symbol," in *Myth, Symbol, and Reality*, 34, Alan M. Olson, ed. (University of Notre Dame Press, 1980).

most able expositors, a recognition in which the renowned Newman archivist, Fr. Charles Stephen Dessain, concurred.

In Chapter Five, Kathleen Dietz's essay, "Tradition and Heresy – *The Arians of the Fourth Century* and Newman's Conversion," explores Newman's very first book, in which she claims the seeds of his conversion to the Roman Catholic Church were already in evidence. She also indicates that Newman's historical research of the early Church led him to discover an "ecclesial instinct" in the reactions of the Fathers of the Church to "innovations" in the faith, or heresy. This gradual discovery on Newman's part led him ultimately to embrace the Roman Catholic Church in 1845. Newman's study of heresy through the writings of the Fathers increasingly informed his knowledge of the Church, a process which, according to Dietz, was "guided by his imagination . . . an important catalytic role in the evolution of his thinking." This also helped Newman see the positive response of the Church to heresy – the formulation of dogmas. Dietz's analysis of Newman's early thinking on the church and its relation to his conversion reflect his aesthetic consciousness and intellectual and philosophical analytical skill brought to bear on his historically-grounded ecclesiology, thus making a strong argument for the importance of these elements of Newman's legacy, which may be of especial value for those interested in issues of conversion and church history today.

The intertwined themes of church, home, and Newman's personalism are the foci of chapters six and seven. In his essay "Newman's View of the Church as a Home: Ecclesiology & Theological Anthropology in a Pastoral Context," Donald Graham aims "to help us enter into Newman's "intense perception and appreciation" of the Church as a home. Graham sees in Newman's 1837 sermon, "The Church a Home for the Lonely," a theological anthropology that is addressed to all who suffer "restlessness in a capricious world." Newman wrote that Christ "left in the world . . . the Church of God, which is our true home of God's providing." Graham issues a call to take the message of the healing haven of the Church to many who need it today – from those who are lost, to victims of violence and poverty, and numerous others who are marginalized. He poses a closing question which is also a challenge: "How can the Body of Christ re-calibrate her resources in order to spend more upon her maternal mission of healing, formation in the virtues, and instruction for flourishing here and in the hereafter? According to Newman, we must assiduously attend to both aspects." Graham underscores the personalist and pastoral dimensions of Newman's legacy as it bears on the problems of the most needy among us.

Robert C. Christie traces Newman's odyssey from Anglicanism to the Church of Rome in his essay "'Echoes from Home': The Personalist Ground of Newman's Ecclesiology: Affection as the Key to Newman's Intellectual Conversion to the True Church." Christie analyzes Newman's development and ultimate harmony of two major tracks of his thinking in his ecclesiological journey. The first is that of religious epistemology – Newman's study of the dynamics of faith grounded in the affections, which became the source of his personalist method. This parallels his second track, his study of church history that grounded his developing ecclesiology in the search for the true heir to the apostolic church. Christie uncovers Newman's dual paths from 1825 to 1845. Newman employed the analogy of "home" frequently in his work, grounding his thought in the early loving affections of home life, culminating in Newman's 1843 description of revelation in his Fifteenth University Sermon: "They are echoes from Home." Building upon this sermon, his *Essay on Development* harmonized the religious epistemological and ecclesiastical tracks more elaborately in his "great law of development" wherein faith, grounded in the affections, and doctrine, grounded in the intellect, are inseparable. Newman's work on these two parallel tracks and their harmonization offer guidance for those today with questions about their own issues of faith (and the dynamics of personalism), including conversion, on the one hand, and church and historical research, on the other, major elements of Newman's legacy.

Education and pedagogy are the concerns of chapters eight and nine. In his essay, "Recovering the Lost Tradition of Catholic Higher Education: The Enduring Relevance of Newman's Insights for the Contemporary University," Mark Jubulis considers two areas: the state of contemporary higher education, including Catholic universities, and Newman's educational philosophy as expressed in *The Idea of a University*. Through the technological innovations of our age, Jubulis notes, education is becoming increasingly impersonal. In addition, as business models proliferate in many universities, economics and a consumer mentality dominate the higher education landscape, resulting in one-dimensional students "ill-prepared to deal with questions pertaining to the proper ends of life." Jubulis holds that "Newman's thought on university education . . . offers a compelling argument for the urgent need to restore the tradition of integrative liberal learning and the pursuit of knowledge for its own sake," arguing that "this state of mind must be overcome in order to see and grasp the timeless insights contained in *The Idea of a University*, which include "emphasis on the unity of all knowledge . . . and the centrality of the disciplines of theology and philosophy, which are necessary to provide

unity and coherence to the whole curriculum.” Jubulis calls for nothing less than a Newman revival with a renewed commitment to the legacy of the Catholic Intellectual Tradition, especially through application of Newman’s approach.

David Delio’s essay offers a unique first-person account, in true personalist Newmanian style, in his “Portrait of an Apprentice” reflecting “Newman’s Vision for Personal Education in the Modern Academy,” resulting from his experience with, and given as, “A Tribute to Fr. John Ford, C.S.C.” Delio recounts his experience as a student and his relationship with his dissertation mentor Fr. Ford, the author of the first essay in this volume. “I want to bring out my encounters with Newman through Fr. Ford,” says Delio, and he narrates how he advanced from self-doubting graduate student to a Ph. D. in theology “through the sagacious patience of Fr. Ford. Drawing parallels between Ford’s pedagogy and that of Newman, he quickly developed a trust that “was due to the personalist influence of Fr. Ford.” Delio describes this as the master-apprentice relationship, “which Newman had articulated and Fr. Ford had imbibed.” In an age in which education is becoming ever more impersonal through large class sizes and technological methods of delivery, Delio’s personal story brings to life Newman’s personalist pedagogy, reminiscent of Newman’s commitment to a personalist pedagogy as early as his role as Tutor of Oxford, and how it has passed down through his legacy, a master lesson for all educators today.

Chapters ten and eleven take up the issues of history, hagiography, and method. In Chapter Ten, Edward Short explains how hagiography, often criticized, is actually a very positive method in the truthful understanding and appreciation of a subject, and in this case, Newman. “I shall endeavor,” Edward Short writes in his essay, “Hagiography, History, and John Henry Newman,” ‘to show how hagiography is vital to any critical estimate of (Newman’s) legacy.’” Short explains how hagiography helps us to understand the saint in Newman. Those who seek to explore and understand holiness, a major element of Newman’s legacy, as well as the value of hagiography, will find much to reflect upon in Short’s essay.

In the eleventh essay, “John Henry Newman and His Distorters,” Ian Ker analyzes three groups that distort Newman’s legacy: extremists of both conservative and liberal persuasion, those who claim an unwarranted excessive understanding of Newman, and “historicists” who assert that Newman studies suffers from the deficiency of theologians who lack a proper historical perspective. Ker writes that “lesser minds, grappling with the complexity and subtlety of his thought, have been constantly tempted to pigeon-hole him, by cutting his originality down to size.” Ker describes

Newman as a “conservative radical,” neither conservative nor radical, who cannot be claimed by extremists of any particular camp, especially many liberal scholars who claim Newman to support an interpretation of rupture or radical change emanating from Vatican II. Further, Ker holds that similar misinterpretations occur regarding Newman’s thoughts on the laity. Newman’s view of conscience is that it is answerable to higher authority, contrary to liberal misinterpretation, which Ker calls “the most serious hijacking of Newman for the liberal cause.” Those who challenge when Newman arrived at his theory of doctrinal development are proved to be erroneous, and finally, Ker critiques the “historicists,” focusing on an analysis of their faulty methodology. Ker’s article is required reading for those interested in the contemporary direction of Newman studies and the accurate interpretation of his legacy.

The volume closes with Chapter Twelve in which I offer a short biography of Newman from the perspective of his dramatic and often painful life in his search for truth, wherever it led him, frequently suffering rejection and ridicule in that search. He engaged the world, including civil society and the church, with both head and heart in his passionate quest for truth. The dramatic nature of his life is evident in the major sufferings, rebukes, and failures he suffered in every decade of his life, despite his significant accomplishments. That is why I have chosen the framework of a drama in three acts to describe his life in this concluding chapter. Such was a life committed to finding truth and persevering in the accompanying moral decisions necessary in that journey. The story of the man, seen from the perspective of a drama as he lived it, is a fitting conclusion to this collection. Readers unfamiliar with Newman may wish to read this chapter first to learn more about him before engaging the essays, and Newman scholars may appreciate the choice of the dramatic motif, which seeks to reflect the trials, tribulations, and ultimately successful journey of a soul who has joined the ranks of the saints, whose legacy we are privileged to humbly extol herein.

CHAPTER ONE

ELEVEN MAJOR ELEMENTS OF NEWMAN'S LEGACY CRITICAL FOR OUR TIME

ROBERT C. CHRISTIE

Eleven Elements of Newman's Legacy

- (1) *Personalism*
- (2) *An aesthetic consciousness "of the whole"*
- (3) *His critical analytic philosophical method*
- (4) *A personal story of his multi-faceted journey of conversions*
- (5) *His pursuit of sanctity, or holiness*
- (6) *A vast treasure of scripturally inspired pastoral sermons*
- (7) *An historically-grounded ecclesiology*
- (8) *His philosophy of education*
- (9) *His theory of the development of doctrine*
- (10) *A theory of mind underlying his philosophy of knowledge*
- (11) *His literary achievements in poetry, the novel, a vast collection of letters, and personal diaries, particularly in the service of the faith*

In analyzing Newman's legacy, I begin with two major overarching qualities that undergird and permeate his life and work, his personalism and his exceptional consciousness, which I call aesthetic for reasons I explain below. Newman's personalism was his primary mode of engaging the world and those in it, or the external Newman, so to speak, and his aesthetic consciousness was his all-encompassing capacity for envisioning reality, or the internal Newman. Together these twin poles constitute the dynamics that powered Newman's actions and thinking. The nine subsequent elements of Newman's legacy rest on, and are drawn from, this dual foundation. The study and application of his legacy can substantially enrich church, society, and the individual today. I now enumerate and explore in detail these eleven elements.

1. *A deeply personalist way of relating to people that infused his love and understanding of others, from family to friends to our Trinitarian God.* For Newman, his relationships were his life, and the stuff from which his spirituality, philosophy, and theology emerged. We read in the opening pages of his autobiography, the *Apologia pro Vita Sua*, about his conversions and that he was a man of deep affection, developed early in life in the family home of religious parents and happy siblings. This affectionate dimension of his personality drove his life ever after. In the *Apologia* Newman acknowledged the many persons who assisted him in his intellectual journeys, but he first mentioned their affectionate relationships. Where Newman's heart led, his intellect typically followed, and it often led him to embrace intellectual and even religious positions that he would later reject. Among his primary affectionate relationships were those with his father, the most important of all; his Tutor during his early to mid-teenage years, Rev. Walter Mayers, an evangelical whom Newman followed for a while into that belief system; Richard Whately, an important guide to him at Oxford and whose rationalistic liberalism he also adopted for a period; his younger sister Mary whose untimely death jolted Newman's soul; Edward Hawkins, a counselor and Provost at Oxford from whom he learned major church principles; Richard Hurrell Froude, a fellow Tutor at Oxford whose friendship opened Newman up to the church principle of Catholicism, and whose untimely death was yet another major jolt to Newman; Fr. Charles Russell, the mild Irish Catholic priest who gently approached Newman and eventually helped him to truly understand the Roman Catholic Church, which led Newman to publicly recant hostile statements towards it; and Fr. Ambrose St. John, his fellow Oratorian and great friend at the Birmingham Oratory during the second half of Newman's life, a time spent in commitment to the small community of the Oratorian way of life that he learned from a study of the

jovial and deeply spiritual St. Philip Neri, with its affectionate and small-group characteristics of family life.

This personalism undergirds all of Newman's work, and explains why even though he was one of the leading intellectuals of the 19th century, upon elevation to the cardinalate, he chose a completely affective motto as the ultimate description of his life: *Cor ad cor loquitur*: heart speaks to heart. As Avery Dulles has written,

Newman remains the outstanding master of personalism in theological epistemology. His reflections on faith and reason have proven prophetic¹ . . . Newman's personalism, manifest in his explanation of the devotion of believers, reappears when he treats the means by which faith is transmitted. The fifth of his Oxford University Sermons, preached in 1832, is on "Personal Influence, the Means of Propagating the Truth." The mission of Jesus, he says, was not simply to communicate a set of beliefs but to change the hearts of his hearers, making them like his own. Jesus' evident holiness was what ignited the affection and loyalty of his intimate followers, who felt themselves individually addressed and invited by his example. With the image of his personal presence in their minds, they began to be transformed into images of him, and were trained to succeed him in the propagation of the truth. Each saintly witness receives and transmits the sacred flame². . . Perpetuating the tradition of Newman, twentieth-century authors such as Gabriel Marcel and Maurice Nedoncelle have effectively used his personalist conception of testimony in their philosophy of religion.³

Personalism is the primary element of Newman's legacy because we learn from it the extraordinary meaning and value of interpersonal dynamics as the fundamental ground for truth, a beacon of light directing us to a way of thinking and acting so needed by an age that has become ever more distracted by the technological impersonalism of our time.

2. *A creative, imaginative aesthetic consciousness.* I devote here an extended discussion of the nature and role of aesthetic consciousness itself and as it occurred in Newman for two reasons. It is the most understudied and underappreciated element in the study of human consciousness, and thus its function and importance in the human mind's search for truth is often overlooked. Secondly, it is such a major aspect of Newman's thinking that it is necessary to understand how critically it functioned in Newman's life and work.

¹ Avery Dulles, *Newman* (New York: Continuum, 2002), 45.

² *Ibid.*, 58-59.

³ *Ibid.*, 61.

I have written elsewhere of this aesthetic dimension of Newman's consciousness,⁴ and this element underlies all of his thinking and acting. This aesthetic dimension is a way of seeing the world. Our minds do this intuitively and instantaneously, as it seeks to form a vision of the world around it, assembling within its scope all of the pieces and fragments of the reality that lies within its perception. It has the ability – depending on its level of development – to alert us when something is missing or doesn't quite fit. A primary reason for Newman's enduring appeal and attraction is the fullness of his aesthetic consciousness – call it his insightful awareness or perhaps the interaction of his imagination and his reason. From this aesthetic perspective Newman was led to analyze, reflect upon, and ultimately harmonize all of the data of his extraordinary consciousness, and we are drawn to its magnetic appeal because we sense its grasp of the fullness of truth. I believe that it is akin to what he described in *A Grammar of Assent* as the illative sense. A study of the operation of Newman's aesthetic consciousness can enlighten us and broaden our perspective and understanding of reality. But to understand Newman's aesthetic consciousness, which he developed to a rare high degree, we must see it in light of the other major elements of consciousness to which it is related.

An analysis of Newman's thinking yields a model of the four basic elements of human consciousness: intellect (the drive for truth), morality (the drive for the good, residing in the conscience), affectivity (the drive for love), and aesthetic (the drive for the fullness and harmony of the preceding three, often referred to as residing in the imagination, and which we describe as beauty). Here it is critical to understand the work of the aesthetic consciousness, which seeks to harmonize goodness and love as truth which, when the three coincide, produces a completeness and fullness that we call beautiful. When we experience this in another person, we encounter the highest level of what a person can be - an exemplar of the fullness of what it means to be human. An example is to think of one's parent or parents. Their goodness towards us is grounded in their love for us, and as a result we call them beautiful people. We experience this as a major truth in our lives. The four elements of our consciousness harmonize in this experience. It is just one further step to understand that God is the Omega of that experience of goodness, love, truth, and beauty, because only God completely fulfills these fourfold drives of the human spirit. Augustine's statement of his personal experience sums this up: "Thou hast

⁴ Robert C. Christie, "Newman's Aesthetic Vision," *Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies*, vol. xxiii, no.1/2, 2011, 41-57.

formed us for Thyself, and our hearts are restless till they find rest in Thee.”⁵ This aesthetic expression describes the sense of incompleteness and tension of life, that primordial restlessness that gnaws at us until the heart reaches the state of fulfillment in the experience and accompanying feeling of wholeness in its loving relationship with God. These four elements of consciousness – the intellect’s drive for truth, the affection’s drive for love, the will’s drive for goodness, and the aesthetic’s drive for beauty in the harmony of all these elements – are the primary elements of human consciousness, and they are in fact inseparably interrelated.

Another aspect of human consciousness is that these four elements are reciprocally related and constantly influence one another as our consciousness strives for ultimate harmony of these elements. I use the image of a kaleidoscope to describe consciousness, where pieces flow in and out in relation to all the other pieces as it strives to form a vision of the whole. This is the four-dimensional divine design of the human mind empowering its drive to attain these great four transcendentals of reality, coalescing only when it “rests in Thee.” In a similar way the poet described it thus: “The end of all our exploring will be to arrive where we started and know the place for the first time.”⁶ This is an important fact – that these four drives are not merely abstract but at the core of human experience, and they only fully attain their objectives in interpersonal engagement beyond the self with others, and ultimately with God. The aesthetic quality of mind is inseparably linked to loving affection – think of Newman’s personalism, with the two forming the foundation of his thought and experience. This is what attracts us to Newman, his life, and his work, since it underlies the very fabric of his thinking. One short excerpt from the *Grammar* reveals Newman’s succinct identification of these four primary elements of consciousness:

Real Assent . . . is in itself an *intellectual* act, of which the object is presented to it by the *imagination*; and though the pure intellect does not lead to *action*, nor the imagination either, yet the imagination has the means, which pure intellect has not, of stimulating those powers of the mind from which *action* proceeds The images in which it (Real Assent) lives, representing as they do the concrete, have the power of the

⁵ Augustine, *Confessions*, Book 1. Translated by F.J. Sheed (New York: Sheed & Ward), 1942 and 1943).

⁶ T.S. Eliot, “The Four Quartets,” *The Complete Poems and Plays 1909 – 1950* (Orlando: Harcourt Brace and Company, 1980) 117 – 122.

concrete upon the *affections and passions*, and by means of these indirectly become operative.⁷ (Italics added)

Newman describes the natural dynamic interaction of the intellect, the aesthetic dimension and the effect of its vision on the affections, which move us to action through our will “from which action proceeds,” underscoring the interaction and reciprocal influence of one upon another. A primary source of the aesthetic principle for Newman was Joseph Butler’s *Analogy*, which triggered Newman’s sense of imagination, a mental activity that tends towards a vision of wholeness. The thread of Butler’s influence weaves from Newman’s early life in the realization of the power of analogy to the sacramental principle in reality and ultimately, in later life, to his description of the aesthetic element of the mind. Butler writes that

If there be an analogy, or likeness, between that system of things and dispensation of Providence which Revelation informs us of, and that system of things and dispensation of things which experience, together with reason, informs us of, i.e., the known course of nature: this is a presumption that they have both the same author and cause, at least so far as to answer objections against the former being from God, drawn from any thing which is analogical or similar to what is in the latter, which is acknowledged to be from him: for an Author of nature is here supposed.⁸

Newman made prominent reference to Butler’s work in the *Apologia* as one of his earliest and major influences, especially for “two points, which are the underlying principles of a great portion of my teaching.” The first point concerns us here:

First, the very idea of an analogy between the separate works of God leads to the conclusion that the system which is of less importance is economically or sacramentally connected with the more momentous system, and of this conclusion the theory, to which I was inclined as a boy, viz. the unreality of material phenomena, is an ultimate resolution.⁹

⁷ John Henry Newman, *An Essay in Aid of a Grammar of Assent* (Longmans, Green, and Co., London, New York and Bombay, 1903), 89.

⁸ Joseph Butler, *The Analogy of Religion Natural and Revealed, to the Constitution and Course of Nature*, Fifteenth edition (New York: Mark H. Newman, 1843), 108.

⁹ John Henry Newman, *Apologia pro vita sua* (London, New York, Bombay, and Calcutta: Longmans, Green, and Co.), 1908, 10.